HERITAGE IMPACT STATEMENT

355 & 375 Church Street, Parramatta



1APRIL 2019

NBRS&PARTNERS PTY LTD

Level 3, 4 Glen Street, Milsons Point NSW 2061 Australia nbrsarchitecture.com

ABN 16 002 247 565

Sydney: +61 2 9922 2344 Melbourne: +61 3 8676 0427 architects@nbrsarchitecture.com

DIRECTORS

Geoffrey Deane NSW reg. 3766, Rodney Drayton NSW reg. 8632, Andrew Duffin NSW reg. 5602, Garry Hoddinett NSW reg. 5286, Andrew Leuchars LA reg. 035, James Ward

ASSOCIATE DIRECTORS

Trevor Eveleigh, Samantha Polkinghorne, Brett Sherson, Andrew Tripet, Jonathan West SENIOR ASSOCIATES Barry Flack ASSOCIATES Derek Mah, Hung-Ying Foong Gill, Sophie Orrock,

NBRS & PARTNERS Pty Ltd Level 3, 4 Glen Street Milsons Point NSW 2061 Australia

Telephone +61 2 9922 2344 - Facsimile +61 2 9922 1308

ABN: 16 002 247 565

Nominated Architects Geoffrey Deane: Reg No. 3766; Andrew Duffin: Reg No. 5602; Garry Hoddinett: Reg No 5286

This report has been prepared under the guidance of the Expert Witness Code of Conduct in the Uniform Civil Procedure Rules and the provisions relating to expert evidence

This document remains the property of NBRS & PARTNERS Pty Ltd. The document may only be used for the purposes for which it was produced. Unauthorised use of the document in any form whatsoever is prohibited.

ISSUED	REVIEW	ISSUED BY
21 June 2018	Preliminary Draft for Information	Samantha Polkinghorne
27 June 2018	Draft for Review	Samantha Polkinghorne
16 July 2018	Final Issue	Samantha Polkinghorne
28 March 2019	Draft Revision	Samantha Polkinghorne
1 April 2019	Final issue	Samantha Polkinghorne

CONTENTS

1.0	INTRO	DUCTION	10
	1.1	Background	10
	1.2	Methodology	
	1.3	Site Location	10
	1.4	Authorship	12
	1.5	Limitations	12
	1.6	Copyright	12
2.0	DOCUN	IENTARY EVIDENCE	13
	2.1	Pre-European History	13
	2.2	Development of the Locality	13
	2.3	History of the Subject Site	16
3.0	PHYSIC	CAL EVIDENCE	24
	3.1	Site Context	24
	3.2	Description of the Site	
4.0	ASSES	SMENT OF CULTURAL SIGNIFICANCE	27
	4.1	Assessment Against Significance Criteria	27
	4.2	Statement of Significance	
5.0	SIGNIF	ICANCE OF ITEMS IN THE VICINITY OF THE SITE	29
	5.1	Introduction	29
	5.2	Prince Alfred Square / Alfred Square	
	5.3	Horse trough	
	5.4	St Peter's Uniting Church and studio theatre	
	5.5	Royal Oak Hotel and stables	
	5.6	Wine bar bistro	
	5.7	Single storey residence	
	5.8	Convent of Our Lady of Mercy	
	5.9	St Patrick's Cathedral, presbytery and precinct	
	5.10 5.11	Marsden Rehabilitation Centre Old Government House and Domain (OGHD)	
	5.12	North Parramatta Conservation Area	
	5.12	Sorrell Street Conservation Area	
6.0	THE PF	ROPOSAL	39
7.0	VIEW A	NALYSIS	40
	7.1	Historic Views	
	7.2	Additional Considerations for OGHD	
	7.3	Views To and From Heritage Items in the Immediate Vicinity of THe Site	
	7.4	Views from the Conservation Areas in the Vicinity of the Site	
	7.5	Setting of Heritage Items in the Vicinity of the Site	
	7.6	Overshadowing Impacts on Prince Alfred Square	67

8.0	ASSES	SSMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT	69
	8.1	Introduction	69
	8.2	The Planning Proposal	69
	8.3	The Reference Design Scheme	72
	8.4	Summary of Heritage Impacts	82
	8.5	Consideration of S117 Directions for Heritage Conservation	
9.0	CONC	LUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION	
10.0	BIBLIC	JGRAPHY	85

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Aerial map with the subject site outlined in red. Source: NSW LRS, SIX Maps, maps.six.nsw.gov.au 11
Figure 2:- Street map with the subject site circled red. Source: Google Maps, www.google.com.au
Figure 3: 1790 Parish Map, showing the land to the north of Parramatta River merely as "North side of Parramatta". Source: Parramatta Heritage Centre website
Figure 4: 1813 Plan of the Township of Parramatta with the approximate location of the subject site marked with a red dot. Source: State Library NSW (SLNSW) M Z/M2 811.1301/1813/1
Figure 5: Map of the Town of Parramatta in 1822. The approximate location of the subject area is circled in red. Source: Reproduced from Kass, T, et al, Parramatta: a past revealed, 1996, p113
Figure 6: 1844 William Meadows Brownrigg, Map of the town of Parramatta, with the subject site outlined in red, showing the location of the buildings and the property owner's names. Source: GML Heritage 355-375 Church Street, Parramatta Preliminary Heritage Assessment, May 2017, p7,original source cited as SLNSW, Z/M3 811.1301/1844/1
Figure 7: 1892 drawing from the Field Survey Book prepared of W M Thomas showing the block bounded by present day Victoria Road, Church Street, Ross Street and Villiers Street. Source: Sydney Water Archives
Figure 8: 1894 Water Board plan of block bounded by present day Victoria Road, Church Street, Ross Street and Villiers Street. Source: Sydney Water Archives
Figure 9: Extract from 1895 Parramatta Details Series Sheet 39 showing the buildings in the block bounded by present day Victoria Road, Church Street, Ross Street and Villiers Street. Source: SLNSW, M ZM Ser 4 811.1301/1
Figure 10: Circa 1890s view to the subject area from Old Government House. Source: Parramatta Heritage Centre website
Figure 11: 1935 photograph of the subject site titled "the resumed property Willmot Bros. Church Street and Victoria Road, Parramatta. Source: SLNSW Government Printing Office 1 - 21424
Figure 12:1943 aerial photograph of the block bounded by Victoria Road, Church Street, Ross Street and Villiers Street shows the development on the subject site at that time. Source: NSW LRS SIX Maps
Figure 13:1950 aerial photograph of the locality with part of the development on the subject site seen in the bottom right corner. Source: Parramatta Heritage Centre website
Figure 14: View of the subject site from the south east corner of the intersection of Church Street and Victoria Road
Figure 15: The McDonald's restaurant and car park in the centre of the site
Figure 16: The Victoria Road vehicle entry and exit to the site
Figure 17: View looking south across the McDonald's carpark to the vacant commercial buildings at 355 Church Street

Figure 18: The Ross Street entry to the site with the building at 385 Church Street seen on the right
Figure 19: - Detail from the Parramatta LEP 2011 heritage map. Heritage items are shaded brown and conservation areas are hatched red. The subject site is circled blue. Source: Parramatta LEP 2011, Heritage Map HER_9
Figure 20: Map showing the location of items of state heritage significance in the vicinity of the subject site marked with green pins. The subject site is circled in red. Source: NSW State Heritage Register search http://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/heritageapp/heritagesearch.aspx?isBackToSearchResult=Yes
Figure 21: Artists impression of the Reference Design Scheme. Source: Bates Smart
Figure 22: Historic Views identified in the Parramatta DCP 2011. Source: Parramatta DCP 2011 Figure 4.3.3.4 p 4.3 - 74
Figure 23: View 1 - photomontage showing the view from within the Old Government House grounds with the location and form of the Reference Design Scheme tower buildings proposed for the subject site, indicated with a solid outline, and the potential development on the western portion of the street block bounded by Victoria Road, Church Street, Ross Street and Villiers Street, indicated with a dashed red line. The roof of the Former Kings School can be seen from this location and is marked with an arrow. The spire of St Patrick's Catholic Cathedral is seen to its left. Source: Bates Smart Heritage View Corridor Study
Figure 24: View 5 (part of) - photomontage of the view looking north along Church Street from between Phillip Street and Lennox Bridge showing the location and form of the Reference Design Scheme tower buildings proposed for the subject. Views of St Peter's Church (former) at the corner of Palmer Street is seen on the right in the background of the image, outlined in red. Source: Bates Smart Heritage View Corridor Study
Figure 25: View 5 (part of) looking north along Church Street from the south west corner of Market Street. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls will be seen in the background of this view, beyond the park, Prince Alfred Square. Views of St Peter's Church (former) at the corner of Palmer Street will remain clearly legible from this location and will not be obscured or interrupted by development on the subject site
Figure 26: View 5 (part of) looking north along Church Street from the Lennox Bridge. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls will be seen in the background of this view in the approximate location indicated with the arrow. Views of St Peter's Church (former), the historic building seen for this location, will remain clearly legible from this location and will not be obscured or interrupted by development on the subject site
Figure 27:View 5 (part of) looking north along Church Street from south of Phillip Street. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls may be seen in the background of this view in the approximate location indicated with the arrow. The legibility of the historic buildings in this streetscape will not be affected by development on the subject site
Figure 28: View 5 (part of) looking north along Church Street from north of George Street. The building that terminates the view from this location is on the north east corner of Fennell and Church Street. It is unlikely that a future development on the subject site would be seen from here
Figure 29: View 6 - photomontage of the view looking south from the Fennell Street intersection showing the location and form of the Reference Design Scheme tower buildings proposed for the subject site, indicated with a solid outline, and the potential development on the western portion of the street block bounded by Victoria Road, Church Street, Ross Street and Villiers Street, indicated with a dashed red line. Future development on the subject site will be seen in the background of this view, in the context of the high rise development existing and under construction in the evolving city centre. Source: Bates Smart Heritage View Corridor Study

Figure 30: View 6 - looking south along Church Street from the south east corner of Grose Street shows the inconsistent building set backs on the western side of the street. Future development on the subject site will be seen in the background of this view, in the context of the high rise development existing and under construction in the evolving city centre.

Figure 31: View 6 - looking south along Church Street from the south east corner of Victoria Road shows the scale of development in this part of the street has already changed. The subject site is not seen in this view... 45

Figure 41:Views looking west along Victoria Road from the footpath adjacent to the subject site include Prince Alfred Square and St Patrick's Cathedral. This view will not be affected by development of the subject site..... 55

Figure 44: View looking east along Victoria Road from outside St Patrick's Cathedral. Future development on the subject site will be seen in the background of views from this location
Figure 45: Buildings of the Former King's School at 3 Marist Place. Views to these buildings will not be affected by development of the subject site
Figure 46: View of Prince Alfred Square from the footpath outside 3 Marist Place. Future development on the subject site will be seen from this location, beyond the park
Figure 47: 14 and 16 Ross Street, opposite the northern boundary of the subject site. Views to these buildings will not be affected by development of the subject site
Figure 48: View from the footpath outside 14 Ross Street includes the subject site (marked with a circle) and the existing development at 385 Church Street, to its left, and that at 5-7 Ross Street, to its right
Figure 49: The Royal Oak Hotel at the corner of Church Street and Ross Street. Future development on the subject site will be seen in the background of some views to the Royal Oak Hotel
Figure 50: Looking towards the subject site from Trott Street between Harold and Fennell Streets, within the North Parramatta Conservation Area. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls is likely to be seen from this location
Figure 51: Looking towards the subject site from the north west corner of Trott and Grose Streets, within the North Parramatta Conservation Area. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls will be seen from this location
Figure 52: Looking towards the subject site from Villers Street, between Grose and Ross Streets, within the North Parramatta Conservation Area. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls will be seen from this location
Figure 53: Looking towards the subject site from the north east corner of Sorrell and Fennell Streets, within the Sorrell Street Conservation Area. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls may be seen from this location
Figure 54: Looking towards the subject site from the north east corner of Sorrell and Harold Streets, within in the Sorrell Street Conservation Area. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls may be seen from this location
Figure 55 - Diagram identifying the relevant heritage items in the immediate vicinity of the subject site, circled in blue. The red arrows indicate the location from which the analysis diagrams below are taken from. (Source; Parramatta LEP Heritage Map)
Figure 56 – Diagram 1: Looking west along Victoria Road from Church Street. (Source: Bates Smart)
Figure 57 - Diagram 2: Looking north west across Prince Alfred Square. (Source: Bates Smart)
Figure 58 - Diagram 3: Looking north along Marist Place with Prince Alfred Square on the right. (Source: Bates Smart)
Figure 59 - Render of the Reference Design Scheme addressing Prince Alfred Square. (Source: Bates Smart Architects)
Figure 60 - Excerpt showing a detail of the Reference Design through the podium. (Source: Bates Smart)
Figure 61 - The existing context of numbers 16 and 14 Ross Street

Figure 62 - Looking north along Marist Place with views of St Patricks Cathedral group to the left, and the Convent of Our Lady of Mercy group beyond. The location of the subject site is indicated by the red arrow 66
Figure 63 - Looking towards St Patricks Cathedral and Prince Alfred Square from the footpath in front of the site
Figure 64 - Excerpt from the Prince Alfred Square Masterplan report, p. 21. Circled is the diagram identifying the significant plantings to be retained, which is reproduced below for clarity
Figure 65 - Historic plantings to be protected
Figure 66 - Sun Access Plane (32.7 degrees on 21 June) overshadows the North Easter corner of Prince Alfred Square

HERITAGE IMPACT STATEMENT FOR

355 & 375 CHURCH STREET, PARRAMATTA

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND

This Heritage Impact Statement has been prepared in accordance with the standard guidelines of the NSW Heritage Division to accompany a Planning Proposal to amend the height and floor space ratio (FSR) controls of the *Parramatta Local Environmental Plan (LEP)* 2011 applicable to 355 and 375 Church Street, Parramatta.

This report considers the impact of potential future development based on a Reference Design Scheme documented by Bates Smart. A detailed development application addressing a specific design response to the site and its context would be submitted to Parramatta Council for consideration at a future time.

The subject site is not listed as an item of heritage significance under the *Parramatta Local Environmental Plan (LEP) 2011* or located within a Heritage Conservation Area. Nor is it listed on the NSW State Heritage Register (SHR). However, it is located in the vicinity of a number of heritage listed items, as identified in Schedule 5 of the *Parramatta LEP 2011* and the SHR.

The proposed changes are consistent with those proposed in Parramatta City Council's CBDwide LEP update which is currently awaiting Gateway Determination from the Department of Planning and Environment (DPE).

The following analysis is based on review of the architectural drawings and diagrams reviewed, and on observations made during inspections of the locality. This report concludes that the proposal will have an acceptable heritage impact.

1.2 METHODOLOGY

This Heritage Impact Statement has been prepared in accordance with the guidelines set out in the *Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance*, 2013, known as The Burra Charter, and the New South Wales Heritage Office (now the Heritage Division of the NSW Office of Environment and Heritage) publication, NSW Heritage Manual.

The Burra Charter provides definitions for terms used in heritage conservation and proposes conservation processes and principles for the conservation of an item. The terminology used, particularly the words *place, cultural significance, fabric,* and *conservation,* is as defined in Article 1 of The Burra Charter. The NSW Heritage Manual explains and promotes the standardisation of heritage investigation, assessment and management practices in NSW.

1.3 SITE LOCATION

The site is located on the northern side of the Parramatta River in the block bounded by Church Street, Ross Street, Villiers Street and Victoria Road. It has frontages to Victoria Road, Church Street and Ross Street. It is identified as Lot 1 Deposited Plan (DP) 668821 and Lot 1000 DP 791977 by NSW Land Registry Services (LRS) (see Figure 1 and Figure 2 below).



Figure 1: Aerial map with the subject site outlined in red. Source: NSW LRS, SIX Maps, maps.six.nsw.gov.au



Figure 2:- Street map with the subject site circled red. Source: Google Maps, www.google.com.au

1.4 AUTHORSHIP

This report was prepared by Samantha Polkinghorne, Studio Principal – Heritage, **NBRS**ARCHITECTURE.

1.5 LIMITATIONS

Archaeological assessment is outside the scope of this report and is to be addressed separately. The purpose of the Planning Proposal is to amend the height and FSR permissible for the site and therefore does not entail any physical works. Accordingly, the Planning Proposal in its own right will not result in any archaeological impact. This will be managed in the future Development Application process.

1.6 COPYRIGHT

Copyright of this report remains with the author, **NBRS**ARCHITECTURE. Unless otherwise noted, all images are by the author.

2.0 DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCE

2.1 PRE-EUROPEAN HISTORY

Prior to the arrival of European settlers in 1788 the general area around Parramatta was inhabited by the indigenous Burramattagal clan who shared the Darug language with associated clans from Broken Bay to the Shoalhaven and west to the Blue Mountains.¹

2.2 DEVELOPMENT OF THE LOCALITY

Within a few months of the arrival of the first fleet in Sydney Cove, a party, consisting of 10 convicts and a garrison of soldiers, was established in Parramatta.² This party grew to 100 convicts in 1789, and the following year, Governor Phillip laid down the lines for a regular township adjacent to the river, which he initially called Rose Hill, and later becoming Parramatta.³ Clearing and development of land for agriculture then followed and New South Wales' second town had begun. A 1790 Parish Map, reproduced below, shows the land to the north of Parramatta River merely as "North side of Parramatta".

Between 1791 and 1800, about 20 significant land grants were issued to settlers in and around the town of Parramatta, and a system of leasing lands was established for home building purposes.⁴ Early grantees or lessees in the area often held leases in the town of Sydney and elsewhere as well as Parramatta. Simultaneously, a site was set aside for the market and town hall in the vicinity of Church Street near the Parramatta River. The first permanent dwellings in the new township were erected in the principal thoroughfares of George, Macquarie and Church Streets.

By 1813, there were few structures on the north side of the river, apart from the gaol, just south of the subject area.⁵ With the arrival of Governor Macquarie in 1810, further streets were laid out and blocks of land surveyed in George, Church, Phillip and Macquarie Streets. All convicts were removed into a barracks that was completed in 1822. Public buildings, a hallmark of the Macquarie period, proliferated. Parramatta developed as a secondary seat of government, a centre of agriculture and grazing, and was directly connected to Sydney by road and river. The town developed rapidly during this period as depicted in Figures 4 and 5.

In 1844, W Meadows Brownrigg undertook a survey of Parramatta to identify grants, purchasers and leaseholders and noting which portions were built upon (Figure 6). It indicates the northern side of the river was well established by this time.

The railway from Sydney to Parramatta Junction (Granville) was opened on 26 September 1855. It was later extended into the population centre at Argyle Street in April 1860. The increased accessibility brought about by the railway contributed to the increase in population and development of the Parramatta area between 1870 and 1880.

¹ Kass T., Liston C., & McClymont J., Parramatta: A Past Revealed, Parramatta City Council, 1996, pp 4-6

² Jervis, J, The Cradle City of Australia – A History of Parramatta 1788-1961, Council of the City of Parramatta.

³ Kass, T., Liston, C. & McClymont, J., *Parramatta: A Past Revealed*, Parramatta City Council, 1996. pp. 10-15, 22

⁴ Noel Bell, Ridley Smith & Partners (aka NBRS+Partners), *The Former Parramatta Fire Station Heritage Assessment*, unpublished report, October 1998. p. 6

⁵ Parramatta Archaeological Management Unit 3117 State Heritage Inventory listing, database entry number 2243117



Figure 3: 1790 Parish Map, showing the land to the north of Parramatta River merely as "North side of Parramatta". Source: Parramatta Heritage Centre website



Figure 4: 1813 Plan of the Township of Parramatta with the approximate location of the subject site marked with a red dot. Source: State Library NSW (SLNSW) M Z/M2 811.1301/1813/1



Figure 5: Map of the Town of Parramatta in 1822. The approximate location of the subject area is circled in red. Source: Reproduced from Kass, T, et al, Parramatta: a past revealed, 1996, p113



Figure 6: 1844 William Meadows Brownrigg, Map of the town of Parramatta, with the subject site outlined in red, showing the location of the buildings and the property owner's names. Source: GML Heritage 355-375 Church Street, Parramatta Preliminary Heritage Assessment, May 2017, p7,original source cited as SLNSW, Z/M3 811.1301/1844/1

2.3 HISTORY OF THE SUBJECT SITE

By 1822, the town had spread to the north of the river (as far north as the current Harold Street on the eastern side of Church Street, though only as far as north as Ross Street on the western side of Church Street). The northern boundary of the subject area defined the northern extent of the township at this time.⁶

This area had been subdivided by that time (though the allotments were much larger than the current configuration and much more irregular than the surrounding street blocks). There were two structures within the subject area at this time, set well back from Pennant Street (now Victoria Road). Fennell, Grose, Ross and Villiers Streets had been laid out by the 1830s, and O'Connell Street had been extended north of the river.⁷

The following information detailing the historical development of the subject site is reproduced from the October 2014 *McDonald's Redevelopment – Stage 1 375 & 355 Church Street, Parramatta Heritage Impact Statement*, prepared by City Plan Heritage:

1844 Development

The 1844 plan of the Town of Parramatta (Figure 6) provides one of the best indications of the early development on the site. It shows the allotments at this early stage and includes a number of buildings on all street frontages (Church Street, Ross Street, Victoria Road).

The plan contains the names of the grantees and the lessees for each allotment. The brick buildings on this plan are shown hatched, the timber buildings are shown clear. Most of the structures within the subject area at this time appear to be brick. The location of the current McDonald's training facility is shown on the 1844 plan as an allotment to E. New. This contains two brick buildings, one on Ross Street and one on

HERITAGE IMPACT STATEMENT – 355 & 375 Church Street, Parramatta \\SIZA\Synergy\Projects\18\18163\05_DOC\02_REPORTS\18163_355-375 Church St Parramatta HIS 010419.docx

⁶ Parramatta Archaeological Management Unit 3117 State Heritage Inventory listing, database entry number 2243117

⁷ Parramatta Archaeological Management Unit 3117 State Heritage Inventory listing, database entry number 2243117

Church Street. The allotment also includes a timber structure at the present 385 Church Street, though this is excluded from the subject site.

The current McDonald's carpark facing Victoria Road is shown as an allotment to W. Bergen. This features three brick buildings, located close Church Street suggesting they were orientated in this direction. At the corner of Church Street and Victoria Road (the current 355 Church Street) an allotment in the name of S. Harvey and H. Harvey is shown. Two brick buildings facing Church Street and two along Victoria Road are marked.

Adjacent to this, at what is now the access to the McDonalds drive-thru, was a narrow allotment extending the length of both Harvey and Bergen's properties. It was in the name of Mitchell and H. Harvey and contained a building, possibly timber.

By the late 1860s commercial premises were established on allotments lining Church Street. The businesses were dominated by small scale enterprises for local trade, such as fruiterers and grocers, drapers and tailors, bakers and butchers, as well as the hotels.

1890s Development

The 1890s was a period of growth for this region of Parramatta and is reflected in the number of land surveys carried out at the time. At the time, the Church Street frontage was further developed, though not completely infilled. The rear of these allotments contained a number of large outbuildings (sheds, stables and workshops), and cesspits. This development extended down to Pennant Street (Victoria Road).

There was a right of way to these buildings from the Church Street frontage, in the middle of the block. There was also a right of way from Pennant Street (Victoria Road) to access the buildings at the middle of the site, which has remained in use as the existing McDonald's entrance from Victoria Road.

There was also a building fronting Ross Street at this time (in the northwest corner of the subject area).

The plans from 1892 (Figure 7), 1894 (Figure 8) and 1895 (Figure 9) provide a good indication of the layout of the site in this period. There were three brick buildings adjacent to the Ross Street frontage and each building incorporated a side verandah. A fenceline is shown from the side verandah of the corner property extending towards the structure at the Ross and Church Street corner, Figure 8 below. Along Church Street are a number of brick buildings with fences behind them and also a brick shed, wooden shed or workshop and wooden and brick water closets. One of the brick buildings in the centre of the Church Street frontage adjoins a wooden building described as "very old and partly fallen". The

structure at the corner of Church Street and Pennant Street is substantial. It is constructed of brick with a number of small, brick and wood with iron built structures backing on to it.

The Pennant Street (Victoria Road) elevation also includes a verandah and fenced front garden. This is adjacent to the lane from Pennant Street to access the properties in the middle of the site. These buildings, constructed of iron and wood, are located in the middle of the subject area, surrounded by open space, which could be yards or outdoor



work areas. The 1895 Detail Plan, below, clarifies the location of these buildings and their associated outbuildings.

Figure 7: 1892 drawing from the Field Survey Book prepared of W M Thomas showing the block bounded by present day Victoria Road, Church Street, Ross Street and Villiers Street. Source: Sydney Water Archives



Figure 8: 1894 Water Board plan of block bounded by present day Victoria Road, Church Street, Ross Street and Villiers Street. Source: Sydney Water Archives



Figure 9: Extract from 1895 Parramatta Details Series Sheet 39 showing the buildings in the block bounded by present day Victoria Road, Church Street, Ross Street and Villiers Street. Source: SLNSW, MZM Ser 4 811.1301/1



Figure 10: Circa 1890s view to the subject area from Old Government House. Source: Parramatta Heritage Centre website.

1900s

The key development of the 1900s was the sewering and construction of tramlines at Church Street. In 1902 a tramway was installed along Church Street to service the Parramatta to Baulkham Hills suburban areas. The tram route began in Argyle Street, Parramatta and continued along Church Street and then Windsor Road. It operated along this route until 1926.

1930s

During the late 1930s, a strip of land along the north side of Victoria Road and the subject site was resumed to allow the street to be widened. The buildings along the Victoria Road boundary, were demolished or at least partially demolished during this time. This was the first of various road re-alignments affecting the subject site, along the Church Street and Victoria Road elevations.

The 1935 Victoria Road resumption photograph of the subject block, taken from the Victoria and Church corner (Figure 11), appears to show the property owned by the Grangers family at this time with a shopfront facing the corner. The Grangers were bakers who had owned the property since 1897. They operated their bakery and shop from this building as well as leasing other sections to other merchants such as tailors, drapers and grocers.



Figure 11: 1935 photograph of the subject site titled "the resumed property Willmot Bros. Church Street and Victoria Road, Parramatta. Source: SLNSW Government Printing Office 1 - 21424

1951 Development

Most of the buildings along Church Street appear to have been further developed by this time, except for two towards the centre of the street block (approximately 373-377 Church Street) which had been demolished. The sheds in the centre of the street block had been further developed by 1951.

In 1951 and in the early 1960s, Church Street was firstly widened and then slightly realigned. A section of the street frontages of the adjacent allotments were resumed and demolished for this work to be completed. A comparison of the current aerial photograph (Figure 1) with the 1943 aerial (Figure 12) shows how this realignment of Church Street affected the subject site. The awning of the corner property was removed, and it is not certain the extent of demolition along the rest of the streetfront.

During the 1960s the corner building was still in operation and a one storey addition was added to it along the Victoria Road frontage. The Church Street section of the site and the area behind it and also facing Ross Street was still developed. A number of commercial enterprises continued to operate from these locations.



Figure 12:1943 aerial photograph of the block bounded by Victoria Road, Church Street, Ross Street and Villiers Street shows the development on the subject site at that time. Source: NSW LRS SIX Maps



Figure 13:1950 aerial photograph of the locality with part of the development on the subject site seen in the bottom right corner. Source: Parramatta Heritage Centre website.

Recent Site History

McDonalds has had a relatively long history on the subject site and celebrated 30 years of operation at this location in 2008. During that time they extended into Ross Street and, during the 1990s it appears, they constructed the building on the Ross Street section.

Most of the subject area has been redeveloped by McDonald's who purchased the main section of the site in the late 1970s. As previously outlined, this is in the form of the operations and Training Facility, surrounded by car-parking areas. The allotments on both Church Street corners have been redeveloped as commercial properties.

In 2008 McDonald's also purchased the building on the corner of Church Street and Victoria Road, being Lot 1 DP 668821. The two storey section of the building had been a "Jaycar" outlet, from 1997 to 2008. The single storey section of the building, along Victoria Road, operated as a number of small commercial enterprises, such as a convenience store, computer store and a barber which is the only business still in operation.

The existing two storey section of 355 Church Street may be a part of the building shown previously in Figure 11 in 1935, which was resumed for the widening of Victoria Road. Its current view does appear similar in scale to that earlier building, and the rear of the building does step back from this section. It may be an earlier constructed building adjoining the later one.

In 2015 McDonald's submitted an application (DA96/2015A) to Parramatta City Council for a staged development of the site involving the demolition of existing structures, consolidation and subdivision to create 2 Torrens title allotments, construction of a McDonald's restaurant on proposed Lot A (Stage 1) and concept approval for a future mixed use development over basement parking on proposed Lot B (Stage 2).

On 11 November 2015 the Sydney West Joint Regional Planning Panel (JRPP) deferred its formal determination of this matter noting the following⁸:

The decision of the Panel is to defer formal determination of this matter as it considers the development as now proposed is a lost opportunity to present a major architectural feature on this significant site which is located at the intersection of two historical roadways within Parramatta. The Panel acknowledges the Design Excellence Advisory Panel's opinion that substantial amendment is required to create a building of more appropriate scale and city character in this very significant location of Parramatta, particularly given Parramatta's role as Sydney's western CBD.

Before further considering this application, the Panel will discuss this matter with Council's City Architect. The Panel also recommends to the applicant that they give serious consideration to developing an amended proposal which responds to this issue.

McDonald's has subsequently entered into an agreement with Stockland to renew the site into a mixed-use precinct.

HERITAGE IMPACT STATEMENT – 355 & 375 Church Street, Parramatta \\SIZA\Synergy\Projects\18\18163\05_DOC\02_REPORTS\18163_355-375 Church St Parramatta HIS 010419.docx

⁸ Sydney West JRPP Determination Notice 2015SYW157 – Parramatta City Council DA96/2015A

3.0 PHYSICAL EVIDENCE

3.1 SITE CONTEXT

The subject site is in the Parramatta City Centre on the northern side of the Parramatta River and is located in the block bounded by Church Street, Ross Street, Villiers Street and Victoria Road.

The properties in the western part of this street block, known as 2A Villiers Street, 8-10 Victoria Road and 3 and 5-7 Ross Street, contain late twentieth century commercial buildings ranging from two to five storeys in height. The property at the corner of Church Street and Ross Street, known as 385 Church Street, is not part of the subject site. It contains a three storey commercial building with retail premises on the ground floor that appears to date from the latter part of the twentieth century.

Opposite the subject site in Victoria Road is Prince Alfred Square, a large park bounded by Victoria Road, Church Street, Market Street and Marist Place. The existing development to the east of the subject site includes a nine storey mixed use building at the corner of Victoria Road and Church Street, and a group of single storey commercial buildings at 396-406 Church Street. The development to the north of the site, on the opposite of Ross Street, includes the Royal Oak Hotel, a contemporary, three storey commercial building and a number of single storey houses that have been adaptively re-used for commercial purposes.

Its wider site context includes St Patricks Catholic Cathedral, Our Lady of Mercy College, St Patricks Primary School, Western Sydney Stadium, the Riverside Theatres and the former St Peters Uniting Church.

3.2 DESCRIPTION OF THE SITE

The subject site, with an area of 4,737 square metres, has a 52m frontage to Victoria Road, a 74m frontage to Church Street and a 26m frontage to Ross Street.

The existing development on the site includes a one and two storey commercial building at the corner of Victoria Road and Church, known as 355 Church Street, that was constructed in two stages. The two storey section is a heavily modified, painted masonry building with a flat roof that may date from the 1930s. The one storey section, fronting Victoria Road, appears likely to have been constructed in the 1960s.

The land known as 375 Church Street has a car park on its eastern (Church Street) side, the McDonald's restaurant and "drive-thru" and a two storey commercial building fronting Ross Street that is set back from the street behind a small parking area.

The restaurant and "drive-thru" are to the west of the car park. The main vehicle entry and exit to the site, including that to the "drive-thru" is from Victoria Road. There is a second entry to the car park from Ross Street.

The circa 1990s two storey commercial building fronting Ross Street was previously used as a McDonald's staff training facility. The rear of the building links to the restaurant / takeaway building via an enclosed, above ground walk way. The "drive-thru" exit is underneath the southern section of the building.



Figure 14: View of the subject site from the south east corner of the intersection of Church Street and Victoria Road.



Figure 15: The McDonald's restaurant and car park in the centre of the site.



Figure 16: The Victoria Road vehicle entry and exit to the site.



Figure 17: View looking south across the McDonald's carpark to the vacant commercial buildings at 355 Church Street.



Figure 18: The Ross Street entry to the site with the building at 385 Church Street seen on the right.

4.0 ASSESSMENT OF CULTURAL SIGNIFICANCE

4.1 ASSESSMENT AGAINST SIGNIFICANCE CRITERIA

An assessment of how the subject site relates to the criteria established by the NSW Heritage Office (now the Heritage Division of the NSW Office of Environment and Heritage)⁹ is provided below. It takes into account the historical context and physical evidence of the subject site, which have been presented in the preceding sections of this report.

Criterion (a) An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (State significance); OR An item is important in the course, or pattern, of the local area's cultural or natural history (local significance).

The two land parcels that are the subject of this report were settled as part of the early expansion of the township of Parramatta. As with all land in the area, they are associated with the historic theme of Land Tenure. The property at 355 Church Street appears to have boundaries that are similar to those shown on early surveys whereas those of the property at 375 Church Street do not reflect the earlier subdivision layout.

None of the built elements on the subject site is considered to be an important example of the pattern of development in the area.

They do not meet the threshold for LEP listing criteria, in their own right, or as a group.

Criterion (b) An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW's cultural or natural history (State significance); OR An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in the cultural or natural history of the local area (local significance).

The subject site has no known associations with a person, or group of persons, of importance in the area.

No elements of the subject site meet the threshold for LEP listing criteria, in their own right, or as a group.

Criterion (c) An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (State significance); OR An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in the local area (local significance).

None of the built elements of the subject site demonstrate particularly creative or technical excellence, innovation or achievement.

No elements of the subject site meet the threshold for LEP listing criteria, in their own right, or as a group.

HERITAGE IMPACT STATEMENT – 355 & 375 Church Street, Parramatta \\SIZA\Synergy\Projects\18\18163\05_DOC\02_REPORTS\18163_355-375 Church St Parramatta HIS 010419.docx

⁹ NSW Heritage Office, Assessing Heritage Significance, 2001

Criterion (d) An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW for social, cultural or spiritual reasons (State significance); OR An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in the area for social, cultural or spiritual reasons (local significance).

The subject site has no strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW or the local area.

Criterion (e) An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW's cultural or natural history (State significance); OR An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of the area's cultural or natural history (local significance).

Archaeological assessment is outside the scope of this report and is to be addressed separately.

Criterion (f) An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (State significance); OR An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of the area's cultural or natural history (local significance).

The built elements of the subject site do not possess any apparent uncommon, rare or endangered aspects that would be representative of NSW's cultural or natural history, or that of the local area.

The subject site does not meet the threshold for LEP listing criteria.

Criterion (g) - An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's cultural or natural places; or cultural or natural environments (or a class of the local area's cultural or natural places; or cultural or natural environments)

The buildings on the subject site are representative of the evolving development of the area in the twentieth century. All buildings in the locality are, by definition, in this category.

No elements of the subject land parcels are considered to be important examples of the development history of the area.

The subject site does not meet the threshold for LEP listing criteria.

4.2 STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

The two land parcels that comprise the subject at 355 and 375 Church Street, Parramatta, were settled as part of the early expansion of the township of Parramatta and are associated with the historic theme of Land Tenure. The site has no known associations with people, or groups of people, of importance in the local area. The current buildings on the site do not demonstrate particularly creative or technical excellence, innovation or achievement and are not considered to be important elements in the area.

5.0 SIGNIFICANCE OF ITEMS IN THE VICINITY OF THE SITE

5.1 INTRODUCTION

The subject site itself is not listed as an item of heritage significance under the *Parramatta Local Environmental Plan (LEP) 2011* or located within a Heritage Conservation Area. Nor is it listed on the NSW State Heritage Register (SHR). However, it is located in the vicinity of numerous individually listed items and two conservation areas, identified in Schedule 5 of the *Parramatta LEP 2011* and the SHR, as shown in the following diagrams.

Old Government House and Domain, within Parramatta Park, is approximately 700 metres south west of the subject site. It is identified as an item of local, state and national significance (National Heritage List – NHL) and is also included on the World Heritage List (WHL) as part of one of eleven places that make up the Australian Convict Sites World Heritage serial listing.



Figure 19: - Detail from the Parramatta LEP 2011 heritage map. Heritage items are shaded brown and conservation areas are hatched red. The subject site is circled blue. Source: Parramatta LEP 2011, Heritage Map HER_9



Figure 20: Map showing the location of items of state heritage significance in the vicinity of the subject site marked with green pins. The subject site is circled in red. Source: NSW State Heritage Register search http://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/heritageapp/heritagesearch.aspx?isBackToSearchResult=Yes

As many of the heritage items in the vicinity of the subject site are separated from it by intervening development and roadways, the analysis in this report is limited to the items and conservation areas detailed below. The Statements of Significance for the local and state listed heritage items and conservation areas are sourced from the NSW Heritage Inventory. The Statements of Significance for the Sorrell Street and North Parramatta Conservation Areas are from Section 4.4 of the *Parramatta DCP 2011*.

5.2 PRINCE ALFRED SQUARE / ALFRED SQUARE

(and potential archaeological site) 353D Church St Item Number: LEP I686 SHR 01997

Statement of Significance (SHR)

Prince Alfred Square is of state heritage significance as an intact representative example of a square or public park layout from the Victorian era, embellished in the Edwardian, inter-war and post-war eras. It is a rare example of the early Public Parks Movement in NSW. Significant for the age and maturity of its tree plantings. The oldest, including Moreton Bay figs, a camphor laurel and a Bunya pine, date from the mid Victorian period (c.1869-70s), and are reinforced by Federation-period plantings and later plantings (c1930s).

The site has historical values at a state level as it is the site of Parramatta's second gaol (1804 - 1841), first female factory (1804-1821), as a village green since 1837 and for associations with the Royal Visit of Prince Alfred in 1868. The site has exceptional archaeological research potential related to the above events.

Prince Alfred Square is the only civic park in Parramatta. It is significant for demonstrating the provision of public amenities & services - evidence of local Parramatta initiatives separate from Sydney. The site possesses potential to contribute to an understanding of early urban development and Government administration in Parramatta. The item is of state heritage significance for its association with notable people (Government Farm superintendent Henry Dodd, Governors Phillip, Hunter, King & Bourke, the Reverend Samuel Marsden, HRH Prince Alfred) and events (Castle Hill Rebellion).

The Square with its collection of monuments and mature trees are dominated by surrounding (State and Local heritage) sandstone churches and C19th schools which provide a high quality urban precinct evocative of the various periods of development of Parramatta.

5.3 HORSE TROUGH

Victoria Rd (footpath) Adjacent to 353a Church St Item Number: LEP 1747

Statement of Significance

Horse trough at Victoria Road is of significance for the local area for historical and representativeness reasons. Built c.1930, it is still contributing to the streetscape and townscape character.

5.4 ST PETER'S UNITING CHURCH AND STUDIO THEATRE

(and potential archaeological site) 356 Church Street Item Number: I687

Statement of Significance

Former St Peters Church is of significance for the local area for historical and aesthetic reasons and as a representative example of a mid-19th Century church. It was designed by notable architect Thomas Rowe and built by local builder and stonemason George Peters. It is a rare example of this age and quality in the local area. The site is also associated with John Fairfax (who laid the foundation stone and was prominent congregation member). The church makes a major contribution to the Parramatta townscape. The site possesses potential to further contribute to an understanding of early urban development in Parramatta. The item is a related place to the adjoining Hall, which is separately listed in the LEP.

5.5 ROYAL OAK HOTEL AND STABLES

(and potential archaeological site) 387 Church Street Item Number: LEP 1691

Statement of Significance

Building at 387 Church Street is of significance for the local area for historical and aesthetic reasons and as a representative example of a Victorian hotel. Built in c.1831, it demonstrates the commercial role of Parramatta in the nineteenth century and is relatively rare in its age. The site possesses potential to contribute to an understanding of early urban development in Parramatta.

5.6 WINE BAR BISTRO

16 Ross St Item Number: LEP I743

Statement of Significance

The house at 16 Ross Street is of significance for Parramatta for historical and aesthetic reasons, and as a representative example of Victorian Filigree cottages in the local area. The house presents as having a high degree of integrity when viewed externally and makes a strong contribution to the streetscape and the wider area character.

5.7 SINGLE STOREY RESIDENCE

14 Ross St Item Number: LEP 1742

Statement of Significance

The house at 14 Ross Street is of significance for Parramatta for historical and aesthetic reasons, and as a representative example of Victorian Georgian cottages in the local area. The house presents as having a high degree of integrity when viewed externally and makes a strong contribution to the streetscape and the wider area character.

5.8 CONVENT OF OUR LADY OF MERCY

and associated buildings 2-6 Victoria Rd Item Number: LEP 1550

Statement of Significance

Convent of Our Lady of Mercy and associated buildings is of significance for the Parramatta area for historical, associative, aesthetic and social reasons. The site has a long association with the Roman Catholic Church and generations of this community and with a number of its prominent members. The main building has notable features of architectural styles. The site is unique in the local area and of high social significance as convent and school. It makes a very important element in the Parramatta townscape and its character.

5.9 ST PATRICK'S CATHEDRAL, PRESBYTERY AND PRECINCT

(and potential archaeological site) 1 Marist Place Item Number: LEP 100238 SHR 00238 Murphys House (Presbytery) component of the site

Statement of Significance

Professional, trade and manufacturing practice - example of the work of notable. Evidence of social and cultural life. Site possesses potential to contribute to an understanding early urban development in Parramatta.

The St Patrick's Cathedral Site is a rare and specific-purpose site dating from the early Colonial period. It has been continuously occupied since the 1820s for the primary purpose of worship. In addition to a surviving precinct of heritage buildings, the St Patrick's Site is predicted to contain the sites of other early buildings, landscape features, subsurface structure, archaeological

deposits and other artefacts which are associated with the occupation of the major part of the site area from the opening decades of the nineteenth century. It is likely that the archaeological material present at the site would be able to contribute evidence not available from other sites or sources, that when analysed in conjunction with documentary evidence will provide additional information about the occupation and use of the site, including the living conditions on the early Parramatta town allotment. In this respect the St Patrick's Site is a scientific research resource with considerable archaeological research potential. National Trust (Parramatta Branch): Professional, trade and manufacturing practice - example of the work of notable persons or events - Evidence of social and cultural life - Site possesses the potential to contribute to an understanding of early urban development in Parramatta.

Statement of Significance Murphys House (Presbytery) (SHR)

The site possesses the potential to contribute to an understanding of early urban development in Parramatta. The St Patrick's Cathedral Site is a rare and specific-purpose site dating from the early Colonial period. It has been continuously occupied since the 1820s for the primary purpose of worship. It is within and strongly associated with a precinct where, together with Sydney, the Roman Catholic Mission in Australia began early last century.

It has strongly, well documented associations with many notable individuals - clergy and laity, architects and artisans, politicians, lawyers and administrators - some of whom were responsible for the Catholic leadership in Australia and, as with Drs Polding and Ullathorne, had also exercised an influential role in the development of Catholicism in Britain.

It has been the focus of an unbroken tradition of Catholic worship in the region for over 160 years and presently continues as such.

Both the overall place and particular buildings have a high degree of social value attached to them on account of their importance to the community for giving a sense of identity; for their personal associations and continuity of use for public worship; and, for the Cathedral, as a major community landmark. It is closely associated with the establishment and development of Catholic education in Australia.

The wealth of detailed archival material pertaining to the place along with its archaeological resources provides a rich source from which to interpret aspects of the colonial development of Parramatta and records the presence of earlier buildings - such as the Ullathorne church (the first St Patrick's in Australia) and the Pugin church - of seminal importance in the evolution of the Gothic Revival style in Australia.

It plays a major townscape role as part of an important group of earlier buildings within the City of Parramatta and which have as their immediate setting Prince Alfred Park. It has strong associations with other important colonial sites such as the nearby old goal site, the St Patrick's Cemetery in Church Street and the former Female Orphanage (now the Norma Parker Centre). There is considerable potential, using actual fabric where appropriate, to interpret these important connections.

It has the capacity to demonstrate, through its site fabric and layout, its particularly rich history including the beginnings, consolidation and growth of the catholic faith in Parramatta since the 1820s; changing liturgical approaches; and changing social and professional taste.

It contains items which are both rare in NSW, and likely Australia, and mostly intact, including the

A W N Pugin-designed Early English tower (probably unique in Australia) along with other Pugin details recycled from the 1850s church; and Thomas Sealy's carved stonework - the marble Gothic Revival intramural memorial to Dean Coffey and the sandstone coat of arms of Archbishop Polding.

5.10 MARSDEN REHABILITATION CENTRE

(and potential archaeological site) (Former King's School) 24 and 24A O'Connell St and 3 Marist Place Item Number: LEP 100771 and 100826 SHR 00826

Statement of Significance (SHR)

The study area was originally occupied by the Dharug people. The historical development of the site spans almost 200 years, from early agricultural activities in this area, followed by occupation of the site by the Agricultural and Horticultural Society (Australia's first) for the purposes of forming a nursery garden and introducing fruit tree species into the colony. The history of the site is dominated by the development of the King's School, one of the major educational institutions in NSW throughout much of the 19th and 20th centuries (operating from this site from 1836 to the 1960s).

The King's School, run by the Anglican Church, was the first large public boarding school (secondary) to be established in the colony of NSW, and developed to become one of Australia's notable private schools. The school was one of the large institutions which shaped both the urban form and cultural framework of the regional town of Parramatta in the early 19th century and counts a number of notable Australians among its former students.

The potential archaeological resource at this site is very complex, with various phases of construction, expansion and demolition across the site, most of which occurred during the King's School phase. The King's School represented the dominant phase of development across the site and, subsequently, physical remains associated with this phase of development also dominate the potential archaeological resource at the site. The potential archaeological resource at the site may provide a tangible link to each phase of the historical development of the site. Investigation, analysis and interpretation of the potential archaeological remains across the site may provide information about the nature of the development and occupation of the site throughout the various phases of its history. Many of these remains would have potential to contribute substantial information to our understanding of the development and occupation of the site that could not be obtained from other sources, such as historical documentation. Owing to the continuous operation of the King's School on this site for 128 years, investigation of the remains of this occupation may provide a rare opportunity to investigate the development and changing operation of a major institution, allowing investigation of changes in material culture within the one context over time, including construction techniques, infrastructure technology, domestic and personal items of the inhabitants (students and staff), as well as developments or modifications in educational practices over time.

Archaeological evidence associated with the earliest phases of European occupation of this site (early agricultural activities of the Agricultural and Horticultural Society's occupation of the site) would be of high State significance for its ability to provide information about a poorly documented and understood phase of Parramatta and NSW's history. However, such evidence would be fragmentary at best, if it survives at all.

Archaeological evidence associated with the development and occupation of the King's School would also be of high State significance for its ability to provide information about a major institutional site over an extended period of time. Archaeological remains associated with the King's School would contribute to the historical significance of the site, providing a tangible link to this significant phase of the site's history, as well as information about the occupation and operation of the institution that could not be obtained from other sources.

Archaeological evidence associated with the development and occupation of the Marsden Rehabilitation Centre would be limited and would have little potential to provide information about the operation of this institution that could not be obtained from other sources. Archaeological remains associated with this phase of the site's history would have little or no significance.

The foreshore lands of the Marsden Rehabilitation Centre site are of significance at national, state and local levels, as:

- part of the territory of the Burramuttagal people;
- part of the former Government Farms at Parramatta;
- associated with the development of the horticultural industry and botanical exploration;
- associated with important people and events in the development and settlement of
- Parramatta such as George Caley, Robert Brown and Francois Peron;
- associated with the development of the setting for the King's School;

- associated with the open space created by the natural flood zone along the Parramatta River

The major landscape significance of the site is the spatial relationship between the wall of the buildings and the river. The gracious setback of the buildings demonstrates the principle of picturesque siting, giving the building group a 'prospect'. This layout of the site greatly contributes to the understanding of the early development of Parramatta as an important centre in the Colony and the attitudes to particular landscape settings.

The site of the former King's School Parramatta is very important in the history of education in the state. The King's School occupied the site almost continuously from 1836 to 1964. It was the first large private boarding school run by the Anglican Church to provide secondary education, which was established in the colony of New South Wales. The school developed during its tenure on the site into one of Australia's notable schools and thus gave community status to Parramatta as a regional town/city in New South Wales. The growth of the school is evident in the relatively intact exterior fabric of the buildings.

Many buildings were the work of prominent Australian architects: Ambrose Hallen (Colonial Architect 1832-1835), Cyril Blacket and Power Adams & Munnings, the successors of the earlier firm of (John) Sulman and Power. The stonework of the original 1830s school building and its eastern wing is evidence of the relatively high level skills of the Scottish artisans who were brought to Australia following the depression in the British construction industry in the 1820s.

The site is one of two surviving examples along the Parramatta River of the picturesque siting principles of the 18th and 19th centuries by which large building groups were sited on the brow of a hill overlooking sloping land bordering a river. The site is evidence of the role of major social institutions in the evolution of the physical and cultural framework of the regional town of Parramatta during the nineteenth century. The site was under cultivation early in the colony's history and was used in the 1820s for the acclimatisation and development of exotic fruit trees when Australia's first Agricultural Society was formed in Parramatta (1822) and was given this

land by its president, Governor Brisbane as an experimental garden to grow new varieties of plants and trees. A number of trees over 100 years old remain from the School gardens, some rare in Sydney, such as the carob bean tree, Ceratonia siliqua.

5.11 OLD GOVERNMENT HOUSE AND DOMAIN (OGHD)

Parramatta Park, O'Connell St Item Number: LEP 100596 SHR 00596 NHL Place ID: 105957 WHL 1306-002

Statement of Significance (SHR)

Parramatta Park demonstrates continuous cultivation and land-use from the management of the Cumberland Plain grasslands by the Burramatta clan of the Dharug Aboriginal people and later through the processes of colonisation, from exploration to occupation, including land clearing and building. The first farm to produce sufficient food to feed the penal colony was established here beside the river in 1788, saving the settlement from starvation.

Following Governor Phillip's establishment of the Governor's Domain in 1790 the area contained agricultural land, stockyards, lumber yards, and most significantly, the governor's residence and vice-regal offices. Old Government House at Parramatta demonstrates the growth of the Colony, from an impermanent cottage, built with the limited material available, into a grand residence with some of the finest extant plaster and joinery from the Georgian period.

A landmark site, the Park and House retains historical association with successive governors and was the location for significant interaction between Aboriginal and European people. It demonstrates early town planning and landscaping design and features strategic and picturesque views and vistas, created to frame Old Government House and enforce the status of the Governor over the convicts and free settlers inhabiting the township below. As such it is a conscious recreation of English landscapes of control.

The Domain was used for botanical and astronomical scientific research, and the Park is considered both a European and Aboriginal archaeological resource of national significance.

The park has evolved from being one of the earliest successful agricultural sites of the colony, including the site of the only 18th century vice-regal residence and seat of colonial government remaining intact today, to one of the most important and earliest open spaces dedicated for public use. The Park has continuously operated as a public park since 1857, reinforced by its gazettal as a National Park in 1917. Old Government House was used by Governors until 1855, tenanted by the King's School and other organisations, and then operated by the National Trust since 1970 as a house museum. Parramatta Park retains strong associations with the local Aboriginal community.

The whole site is a unique and rare demonstration of the evolution of New South Wales and Australian Society since 1788.

Old Government House and Domain, is also included on the World Heritage List (WHL) as part of **one of eleven places that make up the Australian Convict Sites World Heritage serial listing**. The Outstanding Universal Value of these sites is¹⁰:

¹⁰ http://whc.unesco.org/en/list/1306
Brief synthesis

The property consists of eleven complementary sites. It constitutes an outstanding and largescale example of the forced migration of convicts, who were condemned to transportation to distant colonies of the British Empire; the same method was also used by other colonial states.

The sites illustrate the different types of convict settlement organized to serve the colonial development project by means of buildings, ports, infrastructure, the extraction of resources, etc. They illustrate the living conditions of the convicts, who were condemned to transportation far from their homes, deprived of freedom, and subjected to forced labour.

This transportation and associated forced labour was implemented on a large scale, both for criminals and for people convicted for relatively minor offences, as well as for expressing certain opinions or being political opponents. The penalty of transportation to Australia also applied to women and children from the age of nine. The convict stations are testimony to a legal form of punishment that dominated in the 18th and 19th centuries in the large European colonial states, at the same time as and after the abolition of slavery.

The property shows the various forms that the convict settlements took, closely reflecting the discussions and beliefs about the punishment of crime in 18th and 19th century Europe, both in terms of its exemplarity and the harshness of the punishment used as a deterrent, and of the aim of social rehabilitation through labour and discipline. They influenced the emergence of a penal model in Europe and America.

Within the colonial system established in Australia, the convict settlements simultaneously led to the Aboriginal population being forced back into the less fertile hinterland, and to the creation of a significant source of population of European origin.

Criterion (iv): The Australian convict sites constitute an outstanding example of the way in which conventional forced labour and national prison systems were transformed, in major European nations in the 18th and 19th centuries, into a system of deportation and forced labour forming part of the British Empire's vast colonial project. They illustrate the variety of the creation of penal colonies to serve the many material needs created by the development of a new territory. They bear witness to a penitentiary system which had many objectives, ranging from severe punishment used as a deterrent to forced labour for men, women and children, and the rehabilitation of the convicts through labour and discipline.

Criterion (vi): The transportation of criminals, delinquents, and political prisoners to colonial lands by the great nation states between the 18th and 20th centuries is an important aspect of human history, especially with regard to its penal, political and colonial dimensions. The Australian convict settlements provide a particularly complete example of this history and the associated symbolic values derived from discussions in modern and contemporary European society. They illustrate an active phase in the occupation of colonial lands to the detriment of the Aboriginal peoples, and the process of creating a colonial population of European origin through the dialectic of punishment and transportation followed by forced labour and social rehabilitation to the eventual social integration of convicts as settlers.

Integrity and authenticity

The structural and landscape integrity of the property varies depending on the site, and on the type of evidence considered. It has been affected by local history, at times marked by reuse or lengthy periods of abandonment. The integrity varies between well preserved groups and others where it might be described as fragmentary. Apart from certain visual perspectives in urban settings, the level of the property's integrity is well controlled by the site management plans.

Despite the inevitable complexity of a nomination made up of a series of eleven separate sites with more than 200 elements that convey the value of the property, the authenticity of the vast majority of them is good.

5.12 NORTH PARRAMATTA CONSERVATION AREA

Statement of Significance

An area of early government subdivision in Parramatta that retains a considerable number of small dwellings and houses built from the mid-nineteenth century until the early twentieth century. In the nineteenth and early twentieth century this area was popular with the proprietors of businesses in Parramatta and it retains much of its residential character from this period. The predominance of small single storey cottages on their own allotments reflects the character of Parramatta north of the river from the mid nineteenth century until redevelopment for residential flats started in the 1960s. This area contains 46% of the dwellings that existed here in 1895.

5.13 SORRELL STREET CONSERVATION AREA

Statement of Significance

An important local road in Parramatta north of the river, together with street trees and houses dating from the mid-nineteenth century to the mid-twentieth century. The Sorrell Street area demonstrates the variety of small and large dwellings built in Parramatta, north of the river, in the nineteenth and early twentieth century. The predominance of small single storey cottages on their own allotments reflects the character of Sorrell Street from the mid-nineteenth century until redevelopment for residential flats started in the 1960s. This area contains 63% of the dwellings that existed here in 1895.

6.0 THE PROPOSAL

The Planning Proposal seeks to amend the maximum height and floor space ratio (FSR) controls of the *Parramatta LEP 2011* applicable to 355 and 375 Church Street, Parramatta. The new controls proposed for this site are consistent with those endorsed by Parramatta City Council in the Planning Proposal Parramatta CBD Amendment to Parramatta LEP 2011 (Version 14 March 2016 - Council Meeting recommending Gateway Determination) and the Parramatta CBD Council Response to the *Parramatta CBD Heritage Study of Interface Areas* (July 2017). The CBD Planning Proposal is currently awaiting Gateway Determination from the DPE.

It is proposed to remove the existing height limits of 24m and 34m applying to the site and to increase the FSR to 6:1 + 15% (subject to design competition).

The documentation submitted with the proposal includes a Reference Design Scheme, prepared by Bates Smart, demonstrating the proposed changes could allow two tower buildings to be constructed on the site, above a three level podium, that would be compliant with the other controls of the *Parramatta LEP 2011* and generally consistent with the guidelines of the *Parramatta DCP 2011*.

The Reference Design Scheme reflects the requirement of McDonald's to retain its restaurant operation on the site.

This development would be subject to a future development application (DA), to be submitted to Council following gazettal of the Planning Proposal. At this later stage the detailed design of an appropriate podium elevation would be developed that was suitably articulated and reflected a materiality which responded to the surrounding context. It would be desirable to have a resulting form which avoided the creation of a hard wall along the northern edge of Prince Alfred Square.



Figure 21: Artists impression of the Reference Design Scheme. Source: Bates Smart

7.0 VIEW ANALYSIS

7.1 HISTORIC VIEWS

Statutory guidelines for the conservation of identified historic views in Parramatta are contained in section 4.3 Strategic Precincts subsection 4.3.3.4 Views and View Corridors of the *Parramatta DCP 2011*. There is no definition of 'view' and 'view corridor' in the glossary of the *Parramatta DCP 2011*, the dictionary of the *Parramatta LEP 2011* or in the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979*. For the purposes of this report the following meanings have been adopted: 'view' - the sight line as shown with a straight line on the DCP diagram; 'view corridor' - the sight line within the view cone shown on the DCP diagram.

As shown in the diagram below, the subject site is part of the streetscape seen in the *Parramatta DCP 2011* identified historic view south along Church Street, identified as View 6, is beyond the termination points for View 1 and View 5, within the view cone of View 9 and the north west portion of the site is at outer edge of the view cone of View 8.



Figure 22: Historic Views identified in the Parramatta DCP 2011. Source: Parramatta DCP 2011 Figure 4.3.3.4 p 4.3 - 74

The significance of these views is described in the *Parramatta DCP 2011* Table 4.3.3.4.1 Historic Views as:

View	Description	Significance
1	Old Government House view northeast to the river, Old King's School building and site of former Government farm.	Key historic view demonstrating the relationship between the Governor, early Government farm and major school institution. Setting of both heritage items.
5	Views north and south along Church Street, including view of ANZ Dome and heritage buildings, St John's	Historic main street and approach to city. A number of heritage buildings.

	Church spires to the south and St Peter's church.	
6	Approach to Parramatta south along Church Street from Fennell Street, sequential views.	Historic main street and approach. Relatively consistent scale and setback of streetscape.
8	View from Marys (Mays) Hill across Parramatta's City Centre to distant hills.	Key historic viewing point from the highest part of the Parramatta Park with best views of the city in the river valley, glimpses to hills behind the city between buildings.
9	View from The Crescent to the distant hills Key historic viewing point from the ridge of The Crescent.	Key historic viewing point from the ridge of The Crescent to glimpses of distant hills between buildings.

View 1 - Old Government House view north east to the river, Old King's School building and site of former Government farm



Figure 23: View 1 - photomontage showing the view from within the Old Government House grounds with the location and form of the Reference Design Scheme tower buildings proposed for the subject site, indicated with a solid outline, and the potential development on the western portion of the street block bounded by Victoria Road, Church Street, Ross Street and Villiers Street, indicated with a dashed red line. The roof of the Former Kings School can be seen from this location and is marked with an arrow. The spire of St Patrick's Catholic Cathedral is seen to its left. Source: Bates Smart Heritage View Corridor Study.

The identified significance of this narrow view corridor is the historical connection between Old Government House and the former King's School and Government Farm. It is largely obscured by trees. The significant view does not extend to St Patricks Cathedral or to the subject site. The Cathedral spire is a peripheral background element with marginal visibility and is not a dominant element in the view background.

The proposed change in the planning controls for the subject will permit development that will be seen in the background **beyond** this view corridor. Future development on the subject

site will not obscure, or interrupt, the identified view from this location, that is the view between Old Government House and the former King's School and Government Farm.

Furthermore, as shown in the image above, the trees seen in the foreground and midground of this view largely obscure views of the city from this location.

View 5 – Views north and south along Church Street, including view of ANZ Dome and heritage buildings, St John's Church spires to the south and St Peter's church.



Figure 24: View 5 (part of) - photomontage of the view looking north along Church Street from between Phillip Street and Lennox Bridge showing the location and form of the Reference Design Scheme tower buildings proposed for the subject. Views of St Peter's Church (former) at the corner of Palmer Street is seen on the right in the background of the image, outlined in red. Source: Bates Smart Heritage View Corridor Study.



Figure 25: View 5 (part of) looking north along Church Street from the south west corner of Market Street. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls will be seen in the background of this view, beyond the park, Prince Alfred Square. Views of St Peter's Church (former) at the corner of Palmer Street will remain clearly legible from this location and will not be obscured or interrupted by development on the subject site.



Figure 26: View 5 (part of) looking north along Church Street from the Lennox Bridge. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls will be seen in the background of this view in the approximate location indicated with the arrow. Views of St Peter's Church (former), the historic building seen for this location, will remain clearly legible from this location and will not be obscured or interrupted by development on the subject site.



Figure 27:View 5 (part of) looking north along Church Street from south of Phillip Street. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls may be seen in the background of this view in the approximate location indicated with the arrow. The legibility of the historic buildings in this streetscape will not be affected by development on the subject site.



Figure 28: View 5 (part of) looking north along Church Street from north of George Street. The building that terminates the view from this location is on the north east corner of Fennell and Church Street. It is unlikely that a future development on the subject site would be seen from here.

The identified significance of View 5, the view lines between Centenary Square and Palmer Street is that of the heritage buildings that contribute to the imagery of the historic main street. The subject site is beyond the termination point of this view line. The photomontage and photographs above indicate that although the proposed changes to the planning controls will permit taller future development on the subject site that will be seen in the background in some parts of this view, it will have an acceptable impact. Views looking south along this alignment do not include the subject site.

View 6 – Approach to Parramatta south along Church Street from Fennell Street, sequential views.



Figure 29: View 6 - photomontage of the view looking south from the Fennell Street intersection showing the location and form of the Reference Design Scheme tower buildings proposed for the subject site, indicated with a solid outline, and the potential development on the western portion of the street block bounded by Victoria Road, Church Street, Ross Street and Villiers Street, indicated with a dashed red line. Future development on the subject site will be seen in the background of this view, in the context of the high rise development existing and under construction in the evolving city centre. Source: Bates Smart Heritage View Corridor Study.



Figure 30: View 6 - looking south along Church Street from the south east corner of Grose Street shows the inconsistent building set backs on the western side of the street. Future development on the subject site will be seen in the background of this view, in the context of the high rise development existing and under construction in the evolving city centre.



Figure 31: View 6 - looking south along Church Street from the south east corner of Victoria Road shows the scale of development in this part of the street has already changed. The subject site is not seen in this view.

The identified significance of the sequential views available along Church Street between Fennell Street and Palmer Street when approaching Parramatta from the north (View 6) is as a historic main street that presents with a relatively consistent scale and setback in the streetscape.

The photographs above show that recent development on the eastern side of Church Street has changed this presentation and the that there is little consistency in the setbacks on the western side of this section of Church Street.

Future development of the subject side in accordance with the existing planning controls will change the composition of this view from some locations within the streetscape. As the setback and street wall height limits applicable to any new building will not change, it is considered that the changes sought in this Planning Proposal will not have an additional impact on the identified views looking south along Church.



View 8 - View from Mays Hill across Parramatta's City Centre to distant hills.

Figure 32: View 8 - photomontage of the view from May's Hill across Parramatta's City Centre to distant hills showing the location and form of the Reference Design Scheme tower buildings proposed for the subject site, indicated with a solid outline, and the potential development on the western portion of the street block bounded by Victoria Road, Church Street, Ross Street and Villiers Street, indicated with a dashed red line. The extent of the historic view corridor seen in this image is within the red rectangle. Part of the future development on the subject site will be seen at the outer edge of this view corridor, in the midground of this view. Source: Bates Smart Heritage View Corridor Study.

The identified significance of this view corridor is as a key historic viewing point from the highest part of the Parramatta Park providing the best views of the city and the river.

The originating point for View 8 shown in the *Parramatta DCP 2011* diagram, reproduced in Figure 22, is at the western boundary of Parramatta Park just north of the walkway that provides access between Amos Street and Park Parade / Argyle Street. As views from this location are now obscured by the established vegetation the viewing point selected for the analysis of this view is a clear area at the front of the tree line, north of the walkway, as indicated in Figure 33.

This viewing point also captures views across the city that are not part of the identified historic view corridor. As such, the photomontage above has been marked to indicate the extent of the view that is within the *Parramatta DCP 2011* historic view corridor. It is shown within a red rectangle.



Figure 33: Aerial photograph marked to show the View 8 originating point and view corridor identified in the Parramatta DCP 2011 historic views diagram with red arrows and the originating point and extent of the view shown in Figure 32. Source: NSW LRS SIX Maps with NBRS ARCHITECTURE mark ups.

The composition of View 8 can be described as: foreground - includes grassed slopes, the golf course and single trees and the tree canopy; midground - panoramic views over the treetops towards Parramatta Park; and background - long range views towards the hills. Immediately south east of this view corridor is the evolving skyline of the city centre in the valley.

The proposed change in the planning controls for the subject site will permit development that may be seen in the midground at the outer edge of this view corridor. The Reference Design Scheme demonstrates that it is intended to implement the proposed controls with the construction of two tower buildings on the subject site. The photomontage in Figure 32 shows that part of the northern tower will be within the view corridor of View 8, at its eastern edge. This will have a minimal impact on the available glimpses to the hills behind the city that are located within the identified historic view corridor. Panoramic views from this location include the hills beyond the city and the evolving development of the city centre. Future buildings on the subject site will be seen at the city edge in the context the high rise development that exists and is under construction.

Views of St Patrick's Cathedral spire, which can be seen in the midground of this view, will not be affected by future development on the subject site.

The proposed changes to the planning controls are likely to result in a minimal change to the composition of the outer edge of this view, as demonstrated with the Reference Design Scheme documentation.



View 9 - View from The Crescent to the distant hills. Key historic viewing point from the Ridge of The Crescent

Figure 34: View 9 - photomontage of the view from the ridge of The Crescent to the distant hills showing the location and form of the Reference Design Scheme tower buildings proposed for the subject site, indicated with a solid outline, and the potential development on the western portion of the street block bounded by Victoria Road, Church Street, Ross Street and Villiers Street, indicated with a dashed red line The tower buildings proposed in the Reference Design Scheme will be seen in the midground of this view corridor, in the midground of this view. Source: Bates Smart Heritage View Corridor Study.

The identified significance of this view corridor is as a key historic viewing point from the ridge of The Crescent to glimpses of the distant hills between buildings.

The composition of this view can be described as: foreground – grassy amphitheatre with trees and glimpses of the river; midground – city buildings partially obscured by vegetation; and background – distant view to the hills.

The proposed change in the planning controls for the subject site will permit development that will be seen in the midground of this view corridor, in the context of the high-rise development existing and under construction in the evolving city centre. The Reference Design Scheme demonstrates that it is intended to implement the proposed controls with the construction of two tower buildings on the subject site. This will provide a slot view to the distant hills between the buildings that will be seen in the panoramic view.

The potential impacts of the proposed change to the planning controls are, therefore, considered to be reasonable and acceptable.

7.2 ADDITIONAL CONSIDERATIONS FOR OGHD

Old Government House and Government Domain (OGHGD) is included on the National Heritage List and is one of eleven sites that together make up the Australian Convicts Sites World Heritage Listing. Its national and world heritage values are protected under the Australian Government's *Environmental Protection Biodiversity Conservation (EPBC) Act.*

This Act requires that all activities likely to have a significant impact on the national or world heritage values of a site, including development in its vicinity, be referred to the Federal Government for approval.

To resolve the uncertainty around this process Parramatta City Council commissioned a study of the relationship of future development in Parramatta City to the world and national heritage values of OGHD. The purpose of this study was to identify, document and describe important views and settings (particularly in relation to areas outside the boundaries of Parramatta Park), to provide future development guidelines to determine if future development is likely to have an impact on the heritage values of OGHD, and to review draft planning controls. The results of the study were reported in the *Development in Parramatta City and the Impact on Old Government House and Domain's World and National Heritage Listed Values: Technical Report* (the *Technical Report*), prepared by Planisphere in 2012.

The study found that most of Parramatta CBD is not affected by the world heritage listing. It defined other areas outside the OGHD Buffer Zone as 'Highly Sensitive' and 'Sensitive' through a process of review of the world and national heritage values, the analysis and mapping of important views and settings, the proximity of OGHD and the consideration of the underlying topography.

The *Technical Report* identifies important views from OGHD and includes guidelines for the nature and form of development to reduce impacts on the heritage national and world heritage values of OGHD. These guidelines are given statutory weight in the *Conservation Agreement for the protection and conservation of the World Heritage Values and National Heritage Values of the Australian Convict Sites, Old Government House and Domain, Parramatta New South Wales* that applies to development in the 'Highly Sensitive' Area. It is not referenced in any other statutory document.

The subject site is located in Precinct 7 – City Edges, of the 'Sensitive' area, as shown in the diagram below. The *Technical Report* states

The 'sensitive' areas of the city are those areas which appear in the middle ground of a view, or which do not feature within an important viewcone. Development in these areas may have some impact, but there is no risk of resulting in a significant impact on the World and National Heritage values.



Figure 35: Precinct Map from The Technical Report showing the subject site, marked with a red dot, is outside the Highly Sensitive area and is in Precinct 7 City Edges of the Sensitive Area. Source: Planisphere Technical Report, p87



Figure 36: Location of Important Views diagram from The Technical Report showing the subject site, marked with a red dot, is not located within the cone of any identified important views. Source: Plansiphere Technical Report, p103

As the subject site is located outside the 'Highly Sensitive' area and is not in a cone of important views identified in the *Technical Report* the Planning Proposal and its subsequent development will not have an adverse impact on the established heritage values of OGHD.

Section 3 of the Planisphere report, *3.0 Old Government House Views and Settings*, sets out a series of Design principles as well as Future Development Guidelines. The future development guidelines have been drafted such that when development satisfies the essential future development guidelines it will also meet the principles, and will therefore not have a significant impact on world or national heritage values. These guidelines would be addressed as part of a future detailed development application, and would shape the form, detail and materiality of any tower forms.

The subject site falls within Precinct 7 – City Edges. The following Desirable Future Development Guidelines, found on page 102 of the Planisphere report, apply:

DESIRABLE FUTURE DEVELOPMENT GUIDELINES

B14 The majority 'green' aspect when looking north and north east from within the domain parklands should be retained such that the tree lined ridge which forms the background to views remains mostly intact. This may be achieved by :

- B14.1 ensuring that the majority of new developments are lower in height than the tree lined ridge when viewed from within the Domain;
- B14.2 utilising materials and external finishes that reduce distant visibility and minimise contrast against the green backdrop such as matt finishes and muted tones; and,
- B14.3 ensuring that the tops of towers are well designed and do not display advertising materials or banners.

B15 In order to create a distinctive 'edge' to the city, and to ensure that the city buildings do not visually dominate the skyline over a broad area, development in this location should be secondary to development within the City Central Precinct. This can be achieved by:

- B15.1 ensuring that the tallest buildings within Parramatta are located within the City Central precinct; and
- B15.2 ensuring that there is a distinctive height edge to the city centre, particularly at Phillip Street.

7.3 VIEWS TO AND FROM HERITAGE ITEMS IN THE IMMEDIATE VICINITY OF THE SITE

Approval of the Planning Proposal will permit taller development on the subject site at the northern gateway to the Parramatta city centre. A future building, or buildings, on this site that is designed to optimise its development potential will be visible in some views from the listed heritage items in its vicinity, as indicated in the following images.

As the setback and street wall height controls applicable to any new building will not change it is considered that the changes sought in this Planning Proposal will not have an additional impact on the identified street level views looking to these listed items.

The individually listed heritage items considered in the analysis in this report are:

- Prince Alfred Square / Alfred Square (and potential archaeological site), 353D Church Street, Item Number: LEP I686 SHR 01997
- Horse trough, Victoria Rd (footpath) Adjacent to 353a Church St, Item Number: LEP 1747

- St Peter's Uniting Church and studio theatre (and potential archaeological site), 356 Church Street, Item Number: I687
- Royal Oak Hotel and stables (and potential archaeological site), 387 Church Street, Item Number: LEP I691
- Wine bar bistro, 16 Ross Street, Item Number: LEP I743
- Single storey residence, 14 Ross Street, Item Number: LEP 1742
- Convent of Our Lady of Mercy and associated buildings, 2-6 Victoria Road, Item Number: LEP I550
- St Patrick's Cathedral, presbytery and precinct (and potential archaeological site), 1 Marist Place, Item Number: LEP I00238, SHR 00238 Murphys House (Presbytery) component of the site
- Marsden Rehabilitation Centre (and potential archaeological site), (Former King's School), 24 and 24A O'Connell Street and 3 Marist Place, Item Number: LEP 100771 and 100826, SHR 00826
- **Old Government House and Domain (OGHD),** Parramatta Park, O'Connell Street, Item Number: LEP 100596, SHR 00596, NHL Place ID: 105957 WHL 1306-002.

Views from Old Government House and Domain are discussed above and have not been included in the discussion in this section.

Heritage Item	Potential View Impact	
Prince Alfred Square / Alfred Square (and potential archaeological	Prince Alfred Square is directly opposite the Victoria Road frontage of the subject site.	
site)	Any future development of this site will be seen from within the park and will also be visible in the background of views to the park from the surrounding streets.	
	The Reference Design Scheme includes two tower buildings that will be a prominent feature in the immediate locality while the area transitions to the denser, taller development that is envisioned by Council and the State Government.	
	The visual relationship between the large civic square and the two sandstone churches (St Peter's and St Patrick's) to its east and west will not be affected by development of the subject site.	
Horse trough Victoria Rd (footpath)	The horse trough is located on the Victoria Road footpath, adjacent to Prince Alfred Square.	
	Future development of the subject site will not affect views of the horse trough.	

The following tables summarizes the potential View impacts from the planning proposal.

St Peter's Uniting Church and studio theatre (and potential archaeological site) 356 Church Street	St Peter's Uniting Church is located south east of the subject site, at the corner of Church Street and Palmer Street, opposite Prince Alfred Square. Views to the Church will not be obscured or obstructed by future development of the subject site and the visual relationship between St Peter's Church and Prince Alfred Square will not be affected. Future buildings on the subject site will be seen from outside the church and in the background of some views to it.
Royal Oak Hotel and stables (and potential archaeological site) 387 Church Street	The Royal Oak Hotel and its former stables is located to the north of the subject site, at the corner of Church and Ross Streets. Views to the Royal Oak Hotel will not be obscured or obstructed by future development of the subject site. Future buildings on the subject site will be seen from outside the hotel and in the background of some views to it.
Wine bar bistro 16 Ross Street	The former residence at 16 Ross Street is located to the north of the subject site, on the opposite side of Ross Street. Views to this building will not be obscured or obstructed by future development of the subject site, and it will not be seen in views to the house. Future buildings on the subject site will be seen from outside the house.
Single storey residence 14 Ross Street Item Number: LEP 1742	The former residence at 14 Ross Street is located to the north of the subject site, on the opposite side of Ross Street. Views to this building will not be obscured or obstructed by future development of the subject site, and it will not be seen in views to the house. Future buildings on the subject site will be seen from outside the house.
Convent of Our Lady of Mercy and associated buildings 2-6 Victoria Road	The buildings of the Convent of Our Lady of Mercy are separated from the subject site by the intervening development at 8-10 Victoria Road, 2a Villiers Street and 3-7 Ross Street, and the width of Villiers Street. Views to this building complex will not be obscured or obstructed by future development of the subject site, and it will not be seen in views to the group. Future buildings on the subject site may be seen from within the grounds of the convent.
St Patrick's Cathedral,	St Patrick's Cathedral is a prominent building located south
presbytery and precinct	west of the subject site at the corner of Victoria Road and

(and potential	Marist Place. The presbytery (Murphys House) is south of the
archaeological site)	cathedral and is set well back from the street.
1 Marist Place	
Item Number: LEP	The available views to this item will not be obscured or
100238 SHR 00238	obstructed by future development of the subject site.
Murphys House	
(Presbytery) component	Future buildings on the subject site will be seen in some views
of the site	to cathedral, as indicated in the following photographs.
Marsden Rehabilitation	The buildings of the Former King's School are located south
Centre (and potential	west of the subject site. They are set well back from Marist
archaeological site)	Place and are physically and visually separated from the
(Former King's School)	subject site by the intervening roadways, Prince Alfred Square
24 and 24A O'Connell	and the development in the St Patrick's Cathedral Precinct.
Street and 3 Marist	
Place	The available views to this item will not be obscured or
Item Number: LEP	obstructed by future development of the subject site.
100771 and 100826	
SHR 00826	Future buildings on the subject site may be seen in some
	views from within the grounds of this item.



Figure 37: View looking north from the corner of Market Street showing the visual relationship between Prince Alfred Square and St Peter's Church. This will not be affected by future development of the subject site.



Figure 38:View looking north west from Church Street from opposite Prince Alfred Park. The subject site is in the rear of this view and future development will be seen beyond the park from this location.



Figure 39: View looking north from within Prince Alfred Park. Future development on the subject site will be seen from this location.



Figure 40: The subject site viewed from the northern edge of Prince Alfred Square. Future development of this site will be clearly seen from this location.



Figure 41:Views looking west along Victoria Road from the footpath adjacent to the subject site include Prince Alfred Square and St Patrick's Cathedral. This view will not be affected by development of the subject site.



Figure 42: View to St Patrick's Cathedral from the eastern side of Villiers Street. This view will not be affected by development of the subject site.



Figure 43: Views looking north along Marist Place include St Patrick's Cathedral and Prince Alfred Square. Future development on the subject site will be seen in the background of these views, beyond the park.



Figure 44: View looking east along Victoria Road from outside St Patrick's Cathedral. Future development on the subject site will be seen in the background of views from this location.



Figure 45: Buildings of the Former King's School at 3 Marist Place. Views to these buildings will not be affected by development of the subject site.



Figure 46: View of Prince Alfred Square from the footpath outside 3 Marist Place. Future development on the subject site will be seen from this location, beyond the park.



Figure 47: 14 and 16 Ross Street, opposite the northern boundary of the subject site. Views to these buildings will not be affected by development of the subject site.



Figure 48: View from the footpath outside 14 Ross Street includes the subject site (marked with a circle) and the existing development at 385 Church Street, to its left, and that at 5-7 Ross Street, to its right.



Figure 49: The Royal Oak Hotel at the corner of Church Street and Ross Street. Future development on the subject site will be seen in the background of some views to the Royal Oak Hotel.

7.4 VIEWS FROM THE CONSERVATION AREAS IN THE VICINITY OF THE SITE

There are two conservation areas of local heritage significance located to the north of the subject site; the North Parramatta Conservation Area and the Sorrell Street Conservation Area. The established significance of these conservation areas relates to their subdivision pattern and built form. There are no identified views of significance associated with these conservation areas.

Approval of the Planning Proposal will permit taller development on the subject site and a future building, or buildings, designed to optimise its development potential, will be visible in some views from within these conservation areas as indicated in the following images.



Figure 50: Looking towards the subject site from Trott Street between Harold and Fennell Streets, within the North Parramatta Conservation Area. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls is likely to be seen from this location.



Figure 51: Looking towards the subject site from the north west corner of Trott and Grose Streets, within the North Parramatta Conservation Area. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls will be seen from this location.



Figure 52: Looking towards the subject site from Villers Street, between Grose and Ross Streets, within the North Parramatta Conservation Area. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls will be seen from this location.



Figure 53: Looking towards the subject site from the north east corner of Sorrell and Fennell Streets, within the Sorrell Street Conservation Area. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls may be seen from this location.



Figure 54: Looking towards the subject site from the north east corner of Sorrell and Harold Streets, within in the Sorrell Street Conservation Area. Future development of the subject site in accordance with the proposed planning controls may be seen from this location.

7.5 THE SETTING OF HERITAGE ITEMS IN THE VICINITY OF THE SITE

The following analysis has been undertaken to demonstrate the relationship of the proposed Reference Design Scheme to the setting of the heritage items in the immediate vicinity of the site so as to assess any potential heritage impacts on the setting of these items. This analysis of the setting of the heritage items is separate to the analysis of the view impacts set out in the preceding section, as they essentially assess a closer appreciation of the items.

It should be reiterated here that this application is for a site specific planning proposal to amend the FSR and height controls of the Parramatta LEP. Future development of the site will require approval of a development application (DA) by Parramatta City Council and will be subject to the heritage provisions of the *Parramatta LEP 2011* and the guidelines of the *Parramatta DCP 2011*, and will be assessed accordingly.



Figure 55 - Diagram identifying the relevant heritage items in the immediate vicinity of the subject site, circled in blue. The red arrows indicate the location from which the analysis diagrams below are taken from. (Source; Parramatta LEP Heritage Map)



Figure 56 – Diagram 1: Looking west along Victoria Road from Church Street. (Source: Bates Smart)



Figure 57 - Diagram 2: Looking north west across Prince Alfred Square. (Source: Bates Smart)



Figure 58 - Diagram 3: Looking north along Marist Place with Prince Alfred Square on the right. (Source: Bates Smart)

The diagrams above set out a proposed podium envelope located on Victoria Road, with towers behind, facing onto Prince Alfred Square. Whilst it is acknowledged that this is a reference design for the purposes of the planning proposal, and as such detailed articulation and setbacks only address a proposed envelope, a clear relationship between a podium form and the surrounding development can be envisaged. The Reference Design Scheme contemplates



Figure 59 - Render of the Reference Design Scheme addressing Prince Alfred Square. (Source: Bates Smart Architects)

The proposed development envelope, whilst notably taller, includes a three storey podium, with the tower set back behind. The architectural form of the podium contemplated in the Reference Design Scheme envisages a glazed, open façade, with double height columns and protective awnings wrapping around a curved corner. Elements of landscape are included along the street edge facing Prince Alfred Square. The suggestion being to develop a green interface that both breaks up the facade and avoids a hard edge along the street wall and further to widen the green space established by Prince Alfred Square.



Figure 60 - Excerpt showing a detail of the Reference Design through the podium. (Source: Bates Smart)

The following table assesses the impact of the planning proposal on the setting of individually listed heritage items located in the immediate vicinity of the subject site:

Heritage Item:	Image:
Item: I686 Prince Alfred Square / Alfred Square (& potential archaeological site), 353D Church Street,	
SHR 01997	Potential Impact on Setting: In terms of assessing the heritage setting for Prince Alfred Square the existing roads around the edge of the park create a separation zone, both physically and visually. The primary method of enjoying the park is at ground level, as people move through and around this open space. The proposal will not alter this action, nor the ability to understand and appreciate the landscape qualities of the park setting.
	The northern edge of the streetscape to the north of the square will be altered in scale, however there will be not change to the understanding or appreciation of Prince Alfred Square.
	For these reasons there will be an acceptable heritage impact on the setting of Prince Alfred Square.

Item: I747 Horse trough, Victoria Rd (footpath) Adjacent to 353a Church St	Potential Impact on Setting: The trough is a small scaled element, the significance of which is appreciated only at close range, from the footpath or the park. Whilst the proposal will introduce a substantial new element in the vicnity of the trough, how this item is understood and appreciated will not be altered. For these reasons there will be an acceptable heritage impact on the setting of the horse trough.
Item: I742 Single storey residence, 14 Ross Street Item: I743 Wine bar bistro, 16 Ross Street	For these reasons there will be no heritage impact on the setting of the

Item: 1691 Royal Oak Hotel and stables (and potential archaeological site), 387 Church Street,	Potential Impact on Setting: The Royal Oak Hotel occupies the corner immediately adjacent and across from the subject site. This large two storey public house continues to be operated as a pub and is clearly discerned as such from the public domain. The setting to the east of Church Street is multi storey and contemporary, with views of higher buildings forming part of the visual setting.
	The proposed envelope will alter the setting of the building by introducting a substantial building form in close proximity to the item. This is an adverse heritage impact, however the building will continue to be recognised as an historic public house, and as such the proposal is acceptable. To mitigate any adverse impacts, the design of any future building about the data is a light the Paul Oak Listel to be algorithmicing and
	should be detailed to allow the Royal Oak Hotel to be clearly viewed and appreciated, and to not detract from appreciating the building.
Item: I550 Convent of Our Lady of Mercy and associated buildings, 2-6 Victoria Road	Potential Impact on Setting:
	The group of buildings which comprise the Convent of Our Lady of Mercy is set away and back from the subject site. The setting of these buildings are firstly contained within their own understanding of the group, and secondly in the context of St Patrick's Cathedral immediately to the south and the similarly proportioned buildings to the east.
	For these reasons there will be no adverse heritage impact on the setting of the group of buildings which comprise The Convent of Our Lady of Mercy.

Item: 1687 St Peter's Uniting Church and studio theatre (and potential archaeological site), 356 Church Street



Potential Impact on Setting:

St Peter's Uniting Church is separated from the subject site by Church Street and is located opposite Prince Alfred Square. The park in conjunction with the surrounding roadways create a relatively open, albeit urban, setting for the front of the church. To the rear and the north and south of the site recent development crowds views of the Church.

The location of the subject site, generally indicated by the red arrow, is separated from St Peter's sufficiently as as to not alter any understanding of the setting of the church building, and as such has an acceptable heritage impact.

Item: 100238

St Patrick's Cathedral, presbytery and precinct (and potential archaeological site), 1 Marist Place, SHR 00238 Murphy's House (Presbytery) component of the site



Figure 62 - Looking north along Marist Place with views of St Patricks Cathedral group to the left, and the Convent of Our Lady of Mercy group beyond. The location of the subject site is indicated by the red arrow



Figure 63 - Looking towards St Patricks Cathedral and Prince Alfred Square from the footpath in front of the site.

Potential Impact on Setting: The images above demonstrate that the setting of the Cathedral group will not be adversely impacted by the proposal as they are sufficiently physically removed from the subject site.
The appreciation of their architectural character and form is neither obscured nor diminished, and such the proposal is acceptable.

7.6 OVERSHADOWING IMPACTS ON PRINCE ALFRED SQUARE

In assessing the heritage impacts on Prince Alfred Square and its gardens from potential overshadowing identification of the significant plantings has been sourced from the *Prince Alfred Square Masterplan* prepared by Gallagher Studio in collaboration with Casey & Lowe, dated 24 October 2014.

The following graphic identifies those aspects of the square which have historical significance and should be conserved and protected.



Figure 64 - Excerpt from the Prince Alfred Square Masterplan report, p. 21. Circled is the diagram identifying the significant plantings to be retained, which is reproduced below for clarity.



Figure 65 - Historic plantings to be protected.

Figure 66 - Sun Access Plane (32.7 degrees on 21 June) overshadows the North Easter corner of Prince Alfred Square.

The above significant plantings diagram assessed against the shadow diagram adjacent demonstrates that the overshadowing of Prince Alfred Square, using the envelope of the Reference Design Scheme, does not adversely impact on the significant plantings, or the park area generally.

8.0 ASSESSMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT

8.1 INTRODUCTION

The site specific Planning Proposal seeks to amend the maximum height and floor space ratio (FSR) controls of the *Parramatta LEP 2011* applicable to 355 and 375 Church Street, Parramatta.

A Reference Design Scheme has been prepared by Bates Smart to confirm that the proposed changes can be implemented with a built form that complies with the other controls of the *Parramatta LEP 2011* and is generally consistent with the guidelines of the *Parramatta DCP 2011*.

This Heritage Impact Statement has been prepared using the impact assessment criteria of the New South Wales Heritage Council endorsed guidelines, *Statements of Heritage Impact*. It evaluates the Reference Design Scheme in relation to the heritage controls of the *Parramatta LEP 2011* and the relevant heritage guidelines of the *Parramatta DCP 2011*.

8.2 THE PLANNING PROPOSAL

The Planning Proposal seeks to amend the controls of the *Parramatta LEP 2011* to remove the existing height limits of 24m and 34m applying to the subject site and to increase the FSR to 6:1 + 15% (subject to design competition).

The new controls proposed for this site are consistent with those endorsed by Parramatta City Council in the *Planning Proposal Parramatta CBD Amendment to Parramatta LEP 2011* (Version 14 March 2016 - Council Meeting recommending Gateway Determination) and the *Parramatta CBD Council Response to the Parramatta CBD Heritage Study of Interface Areas* (July 2017). The Parramatta CBD Planning Proposal (Parramatta CBD PP) is currently awaiting Gateway Determination from the DPE.

Parramatta City Council's CBD PP seeks to implement a new planning framework for the CBD in line with the NSW Government's metropolitan planning to grow Parramatta as Sydney's second CBD and "Central City".¹¹ Its vision for the future development of the Parramatta CBD includes the creation of an attractive and distinctive city skyline. This has already commenced with the approval of site specific planning proposals and subsequent development applications in the city centre.

The existing planning controls for the subject site include height limits of 34 metres at the corner of Victoria Road and Church Street, and 24 metres on the rest of the site. The Reference Design Scheme prepared by Bates Smart proposes implementation of the amended FSR controls with a development that includes two tower buildings of up to 96.3metres in height.

As no buildings on the subject site are listed heritage items and the site is not located within a heritage conservation area, the heritage considerations for this Planning Proposal are the potential impacts of the change in views and setting of the heritage items in the vicinity of the subject site and overshadowing that could result from the proposed changes. Overshadowing is essentially an amenity issue and not a heritage impact and is addressed in the reports of others.

HERITAGE IMPACT STATEMENT – 355 & 375 Church Street, Parramatta \\SIZA\Synergy\Projects\18\18163\05_DOC\02_REPORTS\18163_355-375 Church St Parramatta HIS 010419.docx

¹¹ Business Paper for Parramatta City Council Meeting of 23 April 2018, Item 13.4 Parramatta CBD Planning Proposal Update

The Parramatta CBD PP submission included a study prepared by Urbis in December 2015 titled *Heritage Study – CBD Planning Controls Parramatta City Council*. Appendix B of this study assessed the impact of the Parramatta CBD PP on Significant View Corridors. It includes the following comment / assessment of impacts in relation to the Historic Views identified in the *Parramatta DCP 2011* that may be affected by future development on the subject site.

View / Vista	Significance	Comment / Assessment of Impacts
View 1 OGH view northeast to the river, Old King's School Building and site of former Government Farm	Key historic view demonstrating the relationship between the Governor, early Government farm and major school institution. Setting of both heritage items.	These views are not significantly impacted by the PPA as the Park / Domain is buffered by the Park Edge Special Area which is excluded from the PPA. This view is not considered to be impacted by the subject PPA.
View 5 Views north and south along Church Street, including view of ANZ Dome heritage buildings, St John's church spires to the south and St Peter's church	Heritage buildings	As detailed in section 5.2 potential impacts to the northern and southern vistas of Church Street are able to be mitigated via the application of a podium height control under the LEP, to ensure a minimum setback of 18m for all development fronting Church Street. It is considered that potential impacts to this view are able to be mitigated within the context of the subject PPA.
View 6 Approach to Parramatta south along Church Street from Fennell Street, sequential views	Historic main street approach. Relatively consistent scale and setback of streetscape.	Potential impacts to the significant view are able to be mitigated through retention of the current view and vista provisions which require retention of this view corridor. It is considered that potential impacts to this view are able to be mitigated within the context of the subject PPA.
View 8 View from May's Hill across Parramatta' City Centre to distant hills	Key historic viewing point from the highest part of the Parramatta Park with best views of the city in the river valley, glimpse to hills behind the city between buildings.	Potential impacts are partly mitigated by the buffer of the Park Edge Special Area which is excluded from the PPA. There is some potential for impacts on the long distance views, as the PPA allows for an intensification of development on the northern periphery of the CBD, which incorporates a transition of development up to FSRs of 6:1.
		It is noted that there has been some development of a larger scale on the north side and the view presently allows for 'glimpses' of hill views through development, which would also be consistent with the PPA although they would be more limited.

		Potential impacts to the long distance views form Mays Hill are considered reasonable and it is noted that some multistorey development is already apparent in this view, particularly within the CBD core south of the river.
<i>View 9</i> <i>View from The</i> <i>Crescent to the distant</i> <i>hills, key historic</i> <i>viewing point from the</i> <i>ridge of The Crescent</i>	Key historic viewing point from the ridge of The Crescent to glimpses of distant hills between buildings	Potential impacts are partly mitigated by the buffer of the Park Edge Special Area which is excluded from the PPA. There is some potential for impacts on the long distance views, as the PPA allows for an intensification of development on the northern periphery of the CBD, which incorporates a transition of development up to FSRs of 6:1. It is noted that there has been some development of a larger scale on the north side and the view presently allows for 'glimpses' of hill views through development, which would also be consistent with the PPA although they would be more limited. Potential impacts to the long distance views from The Crescent are considered reasonable and some development is apparent in long distance views to the east towards the CBD core.

The analysis of the potential heritage impacts of the Reference Design Scheme in the following subsections of this report concludes that it would have an acceptable impact on the historic views identified in the *Parramatta DCP 2011* and the established significance and setting of the listed heritage items in its vicinity.

Future development of the site will require approval of a development application (DA) by Parramatta City Council and will be subject to the heritage provisions of the *Parramatta LEP 2011* and the guidelines of the *Parramatta DCP 2011*, and will be assessed accordingly.

NBRS ARCHITECTURE concurs with the findings of the Urbis *Heritage Study – CBD Planning Controls Parramatta City Council* that any adverse impacts on Significant View Corridors can be adequately managed and mitigated in the DA process.

The Hector Abrahams Architects (HHA) *Parramatta CBD Heritage Interface Study* (June 2017) was commissioned by Council in response to issues that were raised during the processing of site specific planning proposals within the CBD since the Parramatta CBD PP was prepared, and to advice provided by the Heritage Council of NSW in relation to the approach taken for these areas in the Parramatta CBD PP.

The subject site is located in Special Interest Area 1 (Church Street North) of the North Parramatta Interface Area, and is in the vicinity of Special Interest Areas 2 (Prince Alfred

Square) and 3 (Institutional – Catholic) as defined in the *Parramatta CBD Heritage Interface Study*.

The *Parramatta CBD Heritage Interface Study* found that although the Parramatta CBD PP could have some adverse heritage impacts in the identified special interest areas, these could be addressed through recommendations made in the report. There are no specific recommendations in the report for changes to the proposed LEP controls for the subject site and they remain unchanged in the *Parramatta CBD Council Response to the Parramatta CBD Heritage Study of Interface Areas*.

As such, it is considered that the potential impacts of the proposed change to the planning controls are reasonable and acceptable from a heritage perspective.

8.3 THE REFERENCE DESIGN SCHEME

The Reference Design Scheme, prepared by Bates Smart, addresses the requirements of McDonald's and Stockland for an LEP compliant (subject to approval of the Planning Proposal) mixed use development that retains a McDonald's restaurant and 'drive-thru' operation on the site. It includes two tower buildings, above a three level podium and basement. For the purpose of this assessment the Bates Smart illustrative building height included in this planning proposal has been used to assess the impact on the historic views. This shows an indicative height of 94m for the North Tower and 105m for the South Tower. The inconsistency with the setbacks for the towers is considered to be an urban design and planning matter and is not specifically addressed in this report.

The individually listed heritage items and heritage conservation areas considered in this analysis are:

- Prince Alfred Square / Alfred Square (and potential archaeological site), 353D
 Church Street, Item Number: LEP I686 SHR 01997
- Horse trough, Victoria Rd (footpath) Adjacent to 353a Church St, Item Number: LEP 1747
- St Peter's Uniting Church and studio theatre (and potential archaeological site), 356 Church Street, Item Number: I687
- Royal Oak Hotel and stables (and potential archaeological site), 387 Church Street, Item Number: LEP 1691
- Wine bar bistro, 16 Ross Street, Item Number: LEP I743
- Single storey residence, 14 Ross Street, Item Number: LEP 1742
- Convent of Our Lady of Mercy and associated buildings, 2-6 Victoria Road, Item Number: LEP I550
- St Patrick's Cathedral, presbytery and precinct (and potential archaeological site), 1 Marist Place, Item Number: LEP I00238, SHR 00238 Murphys House (Presbytery) component of the site
- Marsden Rehabilitation Centre (and potential archaeological site), (Former King's School), 24 and 24A O'Connell St and 3 Marist Place, Item Number: LEP I00771 and I00826, SHR 00826
- Old Government House and Domain (OGHD), Parramatta Park, O'Connell Street, Item Number: LEP 100596, SHR 00596, NHL Place ID: 105957 WHL 1306-002
- North Parramatta Conservation Area
- o Sorrell Street Conservation Area.

EVALUATION OF THE NSW HERITAGE DIVISION GUIDELINES

The following assessment is based on the assessment criteria set out in the NSW Heritage Office (now Heritage Division) publication 'Statements of Heritage Impact', contained within the NSW Heritage Manual. The standard format has been adapted to suit the circumstances of this application.

As the subject site is not heritage listed and the existing buildings have no identified heritage significance, from a heritage perspective there are no statutory considerations relating to their demolition. The site is in the vicinity of numerous individually listed heritage items and two conservation areas.

The relevant 'questions to be answered' in the *NSW Heritage Manual* 'Statements of Heritage Impact' guidelines relating to development adjacent to a heritage item have been considered in the preparation of the following commentary; they are:

- How is the impact of the new development of the heritage significance of the item or area to be minimised?
- Why is the new development required to be adjacent to heritage item?
- How does the curtilage allowed around the heritage item contribute to the retention of its heritage significance?
- How does the new development affect views to, and from, the heritage item? What has been done to minimise negative effects?
- Is the new development sympathetic to the heritage item? In what way (eg form, siting, proportions, design)?
- Will the additions visually dominate the heritage item? How has this been minimised?
- Will the public, and users of the item, still be able to view and appreciate its significance?

Heritage Item	Evaluation of Heritage Impact
Prince Alfred Square / Alfred Square 353D Church Street	Prince Alfred Square is directly opposite the Victoria Road frontage of the subject site. It is fully contained within the street block bounded by Victoria Road, Marist Place, Market Street and Church Street.
	The identified state heritage significance of this place is as an intact, representative example of a public park layout from the Victorian era, with later embellishments, that is associated with persons of importance in the establishment of the colony of NSW. It is also the site of Parramatta's second gaol, first female factory and early village green.
	The subject site does not contribute to the setting or curtilage of Prince Alfred Square.

	The development proposed in the Reference Design Scheme will be seen from the park and will also be visible in views to the park from the surrounding streets.
	The Reference Design Scheme includes two tower buildings that will be a prominent feature in the immediate locality while the area transitions to the denser, taller development that is envisioned by Council and the State Government.
	Although the wider visual context of the park will change when viewed from the surrounding streets, the development proposed will not obscure or interrupt existing views to this item. The visual relationship between the large civic square and the two sandstone churches (St Peter's and St Patrick's) to its east and west will not be affected by development of the subject site.
	Implementation of the Reference Design Scheme will not have an adverse impact on the established heritage significance of Prince Alfred Park.
Horse trough Victoria Rd (footpath) Adjacent to 353a Church Street	The horse trough is located on the Victoria Road footpath, adjacent to Prince Alfred Square, and contributes to the character of this part of the Victoria Road streetscape.
	Future development of the subject site will not affect views of the horse trough, or its established historical and representative significance.
St Peter's Uniting Church and studio theatre 356 Church Street	The former St Peter's Uniting Church is located south east of the subject site at the corner of Church Street and Palmer Street, opposite Prince Alfred Square. It is physically and visually separated by the park and the roadways of Church Street and Victoria Road.
	The primary significance of this item is as an example of a mid 19 th century church that was designed by a notable architect. Its corner siting provides opportunities for uninterrupted views of the building from the south and west and it is a strong visual element in the streetscape.
	The Reference Design Scheme includes two tower buildings that will be seen from outside the church and in the background of some views to it.
	Although the wider visual context of the church will change, views to the building will not be obscured or obstructed. It will remain clearly legible in the streetscape and the visual relationship between it and Prince Alfred Square will not be affected.
	Implementation of the Reference Design Scheme will not have an adverse impact on the established aesthetic and

	historical significance of the former St Peter's Uniting Church.	
Royal Oak Hotel and stables 387 Church Street	The Royal Oak Hotel and its former stables is located to the north of the subject site, at the corner of Church and Ross Streets.	
	The Victorian era hotel has identified historical and aesthetic significance to the local area. The subject site does not contribute to the setting of this item.	
	The Reference Design Scheme buildings will be seen from outside the hotel and in the background of some views to it, from the north and east. They will be separated from the Royal Oak Hotel site by Ross Street and the existing development at 385 Church Street.	
	Implementation of the Reference Design Scheme will not affect the significance of the Royal Oak Hotel buildings as remnants of the earlier development of the area. Their contribution as representative examples of their kind will be maintained.	
Single storey residence 14 Ross Street and	The single storey residences at 14 and 16 Ross Street are located to the north of the subject site, diagonally opposite its Ross Street frontage.	
Wine bar bistro 16 Ross Street	The immediate context of these Victorian era cottages that have been adaptively reused for commercial purposes, is the two and three storey commercial development to their east and north. The subject site does not contribute to the setting of these items.	
	The Reference Design Scheme buildings will be seen from the front of these properties. The available view to these cottages will not be affected.	
	Implementation of the Reference Design Scheme will not affect the significance of these buildings as remnants of the earlier development of the area. Their contribution as representative examples of their kind will be maintained.	
Convent of Our Lady of Mercy and associated buildings 2-6 Victoria Road	The historic buildings of the Convent of Our Lady of Mercy front Victoria Road, Villiers Street and Ross Street. They are separated from the subject site by the intervening development at 8-10 Victoria Road, 2a Villiers Street and 3-7 Ross Street, and the width of Villiers Street.	
	Views to this building complex will not be obscured or obstructed by future development of the subject site, and it will not be seen in views to the group.	

	The Reference Design Scheme tower buildings may be seen from within the grounds of the convent.
	Implementation of the Reference Design Scheme will not have an adverse impact on the established aesthetic, historical or social significance of the Convent of Our Lady of Mercy building group.
St Patrick's Cathedral, presbytery and precinct 1 Marist Place	St Patrick's Cathedral is a prominent ecclesiastical building located south west of the subject site at the corner of Victoria Road and Marist Place. The cathedral precinct also contains a number of other buildings, including the presbytery (Murphys House) which is included on the SHR.
	The curtilage of these items is limited to the precinct boundaries. It is separated from the subject site by the intervening roadways and the existing development at 8-10 Victoria Road.
	The corner location allows views of the cathedral to be appreciated along the street corridors of Victoria Road, Villiers Street and Marist Place. Glimpses of the cathedral steeple are also available from the wider locality.
	The presbytery is setback from Marist Place behind the alignment of the cathedral and views to this building are only available when directly outside or opposite the Marist Place entry to the site.
	The available views to the cathedral and the presbytery will not be obscured or obstructed by future development of the subject site and their immediate visual context will not be affected.
	Future buildings on the subject site will be seen in some views to the cathedral from the south and east and will be seen from the street outside the cathedral. Although the Reference Design Scheme tower buildings may be seen from within the cathedral precinct, it is unlikely they will be seen from the presbytery due to its setback behind the alignment of the cathedral.
St Patrick's Cathedral, presbytery and precinct continued	The Reference Design Scheme has been developed in consideration of its context in the vicinity of this prominent building. The parapet of the commercial component of the building at the corner of Victoria Road and Church Street aligns with the eave line of St Patrick's Cathedral and the roof of the communal gym / BBQ area of the mixed use component of the building fronting Victoria Road is aligned with the Patrick's Cathedral ridge.
	The subject site is physically and visually separated from this item by the intervening roads and intersection of Victoria Road and Villiers Street, and built form on the adjacent site to the west.

	As such, it is considered that development of the subject site as proposed in the Reference Design Scheme will not have an adverse impact on the established significance of St Patrick's Cathedral, presbytery and precinct.
Marsden Rehabilitation Centre (Former King's School) 24 and 24A O'Connell Street and 3 Marist Place	The historic buildings of the Former King's School that front Marist Place are set well back from the street and are physically and visually separated from the subject site by the intervening roadways and Prince Alfred Square. Whilst the Reference Design Scheme tower buildings may be seen from within the grounds of this item, the available views
	and setting of these buildings will not be affected by future development of the subject site. As such, it is considered that development of the subject site as proposed in the Reference Design Scheme will not have an adverse impact on the established state and local aesthetic, historic or social significance of the early institutional buildings of the Former King's School.
Old Government House and Domain (OGHD) Parramatta Park, O'Connell Street	Old Government House and Government Domain (OGHD) is included on the National Heritage List and is one of eleven sites that together make up the Australian Convicts Sites World Heritage Listing. It is also listed on the NSW SHR and the Parramatta LEP Heritage Schedule in recognition of its value as a landmark site with historical importance.
	The subject site is located approximately 800m north east of Old Government House (OGH). Implementation of the Reference Design Scheme for the subject site will not have an adverse impact on the established heritage significance of OGHD.
	The subject site is not part of the significant view corridor from OGH that is identified in the <i>Parramatta DCP 2011</i> as Historic View 1. It is seen in the key historic viewing point from the ridge of The Crescent identified in the <i>Parramatta</i> <i>DCP 2011</i> as Historic View 9.
	The Reference Design Scheme includes two tower buildings that will be seen in the midground of this view corridor with a slot view to the distant hills between the buildings that will be seen in the panoramic view.
	This change in the distant outlook, beyond the recognised highly sensitive area of the City Edge, was considered in the 2012 Planisphere <i>Development in Parramatta City and the</i> <i>Impact on Old Government House and Domain's World and</i> <i>National Heritage Listed Values: Technical Report</i> (the <i>Technical</i> <i>Report</i>) and it was concluded that development in this area may have some impact but there was no risk of resulting in a significant impact on the World and National Heritage Values.

Old Government House and Domain (OGHD)	The Technical Report guidelines are given statutory weight in the Conservation Agreement for the protection and conservation	
continued	of the World Heritage Values and National Heritage Values of the Australian Convict Sites, Old Government House and Domain, Parramatta New South Wales that applies to development in the 'Highly Sensitive' Area.	
	As it has been recognised that development outside the 'Highly Sensitive' Area will not have a significant impact on the World or National Heritage Values of OGHD it is unlikely that the proposed Reference Design Scheme will be required to be assessed under the provisions of <i>EPBC Act</i> , if the assessment of impacts were based on the <i>Technical Report</i> as has been done in the past. However, a referral to the Department of Environment and Energy may be made should such confirmation be desired.	
	The 2015 Urbis <i>Heritage Study – CBD Planning Controls</i> <i>Parramatta City Council</i> also included an assessment of the identified historic views from OGHD and noted that any adverse impacts on Significant View Corridors could be adequately managed and mitigated in the DA process.	
	Having reviewed the supporting documentation prepared for the Reference Design Scheme, NBRS ARCHITECTURE considers the impacts of this proposal on the established significance of OGHD to be reasonable and acceptable.	
North Parramatta Conservation Area	The North Parramatta Conservation Area is north west of the subject site. It is bounded by Ross Street, Villiers Street, Albert Street and O'Connell Street.	
	It is separated from the subject site by the intervening development and roadway.	
	The established significance of the North Parramatta Conservation Area is its ability to demonstrate the residentia character of Parramatta, north of the river, in the 19 th and early 20 th centuries.	
	Given its proximity to the expanding Parramatta City Centre, the evolving skyline of the city centre can be seen from some locations when looking to the south from within the North Parramatta Conservation Area.	
	The tower buildings proposed in the Reference Design Scheme will viewed in this context from some locations within the conservation area.	
	This will not have an adverse impact on the established heritage significance of the North Parramatta Conservation Area as a historic urban area, or the setting of its components that are fully contained within its boundaries.	

Sorrell Street	The Sorrell Street Conservation Area is north east of the
Conservation Area	subject site. It includes properties on both sides of Sorrell
	Street and extends from the middle of the street block
	between Ross Street and Grose Street to Belmore Street.
	It is separated from the subject site by the intervening development and roadways.
	The established significance of the Sorrell Street Conservation Area is its ability to demonstrate the variety of small and large dwellings built in Parramatta, north of the river, in the 19 th and early 20 th centuries.
	Given its proximity to the expanding Parramatta City Centre, the evolving skyline of the city centre can be seen from some locations when looking to the south from within the Sorrell Street Conservation Area.
	The tower buildings proposed in the Reference Design Scheme will viewed in this context from some locations within the conservation area.
	This will not have an adverse impact on the established heritage significance of the Sorrell Street Conservation Area as a historic urban area, or the setting of its components that are fully contained within its boundaries.

THE HERITAGE OBJECTIVES OF THE PARRAMATTA LEP 2012

The Reference Design Scheme proposed is considered to be acceptable, from a heritage perspective, as it will not have an adverse impact on the established heritage significance or setting of the listed items and conservation areas in its vicinity and it will not have a significant impact on the historic views identified in the *Parramatta DCP 2011*. It is, therefore, consistent with the relevant heritage objectives of the *Parramatta LEP 2011*, which are:

4.3 Height of buildings

(1) The objectives of this clause are as follows:

(c) to require the height of future buildings to have regard to heritage sites and their settings,

(d) to ensure the preservation of historic views,

5.10 Heritage conservation

(1) Objectives

- The objectives of this clause are as follows:
- (a) to conserve the environmental heritage of Parramatta,

(b) to conserve the heritage significance of heritage items and heritage conservation areas, including associated fabric, settings and views,

HERITAGE GUIDELINES OF THE PARRAMATTA DCP 2011

The *Parramatta DCP 2011* supports the *Parramatta LEP 2011* by providing additional objectives and development standards for properties in the vicinity of heritage items, including the consideration of historic view corridors.

The Reference Design Scheme proposed is consistent with the overriding objectives of the Part 3 Section 3.5 Heritage of the *Parramatta DCP 2011* that relate to development in the vicinity of a heritage item, which are:

3.5.1 General

0.2 Retention and reinforcement of the attributes that contribute to the heritage significance of items, areas and their settings.

0.4 Development that is compatible with the significance and character of the area.

The subject site is located within the Parramatta City Centre Strategic Precinct. It is not within an identified Special Area of this precinct. The controls for Strategic Precincts, contained in Part 4 Section 4.3.3 Parramatta City Centre of the *Parramatta DCP 2011*, include those for consideration of identified historic views.

The documentation submitted with the Planning Proposal shows the visual impact on the immediate and wider locality of the two tower buildings that are proposed in the Reference Design Scheme. The subject site is part of the streetscape seen in the *Parramatta DCP 2011* identified historic view south along Church Street, identified as View 6, is beyond the termination points for View 1 and View 5, within the view cone of View 9 and the north west portion of the site is at outer edge of the view cone of View 8. The impact of the change in these historic views is discussed in Section 7.1 of this report and summarised in the following table.

View / Vista	Significance	Evaluation of Heritage Impact
View 1 OGH view northeast to the river, Old King's School Building and site of former Government Farm	Key historic view demonstrating the relationship between the Governor, early Government farm and major school institution. Setting of both heritage items.	The buildings proposed in the Reference Design Scheme for the subject site will be seen in the background beyond this view corridor. They will not obscure, or interrupt, the identified view from this location, that is the view between Old Government House and the former King's School and Government Farm. As such, there will be no adverse impact on View 1.
View 5 Views north and south along Church Street, including view of ANZ Dome heritage buildings, St John's church spires to the south and St Peter's church	Heritage buildings	The identified significance of View 5, the view lines between Centenary Square and Palmer Street is that of the heritage buildings that contribute to the imagery of the historic main street. The buildings proposed in the Reference Design Scheme for the subject site will be seen in the background beyond this view line.

View 5 continued		Views of St Peter's church will not be affected and the silhouette of its spire will continue to be seen against the sky. Views looking south along this alignment do not include the subject site. As such, there will be no adverse impact on View 5.
View 6 Approach to Parramatta south along Church Street from Fennell Street, sequential views	Historic main street approach. Relatively consistent scale and setback of streetscape. NOTE: The current context is that recent development on the eastern side of Church Street has altered this presentation and the that there is little consistency in the setbacks on the western side of this section of Church Street.	The buildings proposed in the Reference Design Scheme will change the composition of this view from some locations within the streetscape. The proposed podium height and the setbacks of the tower buildings will minimise the change that is perceived at street level, thus mitigating these impacts. It is considered that the impacts to View 6 are adequately mitigated and are reasonable and acceptable.
View 8 View from May's Hill across Parramatta' City Centre to distant hills	Key historic viewing point from the highest part of the Parramatta Park with best views of the city in the river valley, glimpse to hills behind the city between buildings.	Part of the north tower of the Reference Design Scheme will be seen in the midground at the eastern edge of this view corridor, in the context the high rise development of the city centre that is existing and under construction. This will have a minimal impact on the available glimpses to the hills behind the city that are located within the historic view corridor. Views of the silhouette of St Patrick's Cathedral spire, which can be seen in the midground of this view, will not be affected by the development proposed for the subject site. The impacts to View 8 are considered to minimal and acceptable.
View 9 View from The Crescent to the distant hills, key historic viewing point from the ridge of The Crescent	Key historic viewing point from the ridge of The Crescent to glimpses of distant hills between buildings	The Reference Design Scheme proposes two tower buildings that will be seen in the midground of this view corridor.

	This will provide a slot view to the distant hills between the buildings that will be seen in the panoramic view.
	It is considered that the impact to View 9 is reasonable and acceptable in the context of the evolving city skyline that is emerging in Parramatta.

As noted above, the Reference Design Scheme retains the available views along the surrounding streets, does not affect the ability of the spires of St Peter's Church and St Patrick's Cathedral to be seen against the sky, and its impacts on the identified historic view corridors is considered to be reasonable and acceptable.

It is, therefore, consistent with the relevant objectives for historic views, contained in Part 4 Section 4.3.3 Parramatta City Centre of the *Parramatta DCP 2011*, which are:

4.3.3.4 Views and View Corridors

0.1 To maintain and enhance views from the city centre to significant heritage or natural features.

0.2 To enhance views along city streets.

0.3 To protect silhouettes of the tops of major buildings or structures as seen against the sky.

8.4 SUMMARY OF HERITAGE IMPACTS

As no buildings on the subject site are listed heritage items and the site is not located within a heritage conservation area, the heritage considerations for this Planning Proposal are the potential impacts of the change in views and setting of the heritage items in the vicinity of the subject site.

The impact on the setting of the heritage items in the vicinity of the site has been reviewed in the heritage reports prepared as part of Parramatta City Council's Parramatta CBD PP and they have been accepted as being reasonable to the context of this area in transition.

The individually listed heritage items and conservation areas in the vicinity of the site will remain as remnant examples of an earlier period of development as the city centre evolves to become Sydney's second CBD.

NBRS ARCHITECTURE concurs with the findings of the Urbis *Heritage Study – CBD Planning Controls Parramatta City Council* that any adverse impacts on Significant View Corridors can be adequately managed and mitigated in the DA process.

The Reference Design Scheme demonstrates that the Planning Proposal LEP amendments can be implemented with a scheme that affords appropriate consideration to the site's context, is compliant with the other controls of the LEP and satisfies the requirements of the proponents.

The Planning Proposal amendment to the maximum height and FSR for future development of the subject site, and the implementation of the Reference Design Scheme proposed will not adversely and unacceptably impact upon the identified heritage significance of the nearby local heritage items and conservation areas, State Heritage Register listed items, or National and World Heritage listed properties.

8.5 CONSIDERATION OF S117 DIRECTIONS FOR HERITAGE CONSERVATION

The current update to Section 117 (S117) Direction 2.3 Heritage Conservation, issued under s117 (now Section 9.1) of the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act (EP&A Act)* 1979 on 1 July 2009, requires the following in relation to European Heritage:

(4) A planning proposal must contain provisions that facilitate the conservation of: (a) items, places, buildings, works, relics, moveable objects or precincts of environmental heritage significance to an area, in relation to the historical, scientific, cultural, social, archaeological, architectural, natural or aesthetic value of the item, area, object or place, identified in a study of the environmental heritage of the area,

The potential impacts on the heritage items in the vicinity of the subject site and in the wider locality have been considered. There are no changes proposed to the *Parramatta LEP 2011* heritage schedule or mapping, or the compulsory heritage provisions in Clause 5.10 Heritage Conservation, as part of this Planning Proposal. It is considered that the Planning Proposal is consistent with the S117 Directions in relation to European Heritage.

9.0 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATION

The site at 355 and 375 Church Street, Parramatta is on the northern edge of the Parramatta CBD, which is transitioning from low scale in the north west to high density mixed use development in the east and south.

The new controls proposed in the site specific Planning Proposal are consistent with those endorsed by Parramatta City Council in the *Planning Proposal Parramatta CBD Amendment to Parramatta LEP 2011.*

The Planning Proposal amendment to the maximum height and FSR for future development of the subject site, and the implementation of the Reference Design Scheme proposed will not adversely and unacceptably impact upon the identified heritage significance of the nearby local heritage items and conservation areas, State Heritage Register listed items, or National and World Heritage listed properties.

It is recommended that any future development application be informed by the preparation of an archaeological assessment. Should the assessment identify the likelihood of potential finds, specifically relics of State significance, that the proposal details their retention and interpretation *in situ*.

Future development of the subject site following gazettal of the Planning Proposal will be subject to the heritage provisions of the *Parramatta LEP 2011* and the guidelines of the *Parramatta DCP 2011*, and will be assessed accordingly.

As such, the Planning Proposal is considered acceptable from a heritage perspective and is recommended for approval.

schorke

Samantha Polkinghorne Director NBRSARCHITECTURE

10.0 BIBLIOGRAPHY

ARCHIVES

Sydney Water Archives

BOOKS AND REPORTS

Apperly, Richard, Irving, Robert and Reynolds, Peter, *A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture: Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present*. Sydney: Angus and Robertson, 1994.

Australia ICOMOS, *The Burra Charter: The Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance*, 2013.

Australian Government Department of the Environment, *Conservation Agreement for the protection and conservation of the World Heritage Values and National Heritage Values of the Australian Convict Sites, Old Government House and Domain, Parramatta New South Wales, executed 23 December 2015.*

City Plan Heritage, *McDonald's Redevelopment – Stage 1 375 & 355 Church Street, Parramatta Heritage Impact Statement*, October 2014.

City Plan Heritage, *McDonald's Redevelopment - Stage 1 375 & 355 Church Street, Parramatta Historical Archaeological Assessment,* September 2014.

GML Heritage, 355-375 Church Street, Parramatta Preliminary Heritage Assessment, May 2017.

Hector Abraham Architects (HHA), Parramatta CBD Heritage Interface Study, June 2017.

Kass T., Liston C., & McClymont J., *Parramatta: A Past Revealed*, Parramatta City Council, 1996.

Noel Bell, Ridley Smith & Partners (aka NBRS+Partners), *The Former Parramatta Fire Station Heritage Assessment*, unpublished report, October 1998.

NSW Heritage Office, Assessing Heritage Significance, 2001.

NSW Heritage Office and Department of Urban Affairs and Planning, *Statements of Heritage Impact*, 1996 (revised 2002).

NSW Heritage Office and Department of Urban Affairs and Planning, *Heritage Curtilages*, 1996.

NSW Heritage Office and Department of Urban Affairs and Planning, *NSW Heritage Manual*, 1996.

NSW Heritage Office and Royal Australian Institute of Architects NSW Chapter, *Design in Context: Guidelines for Infill Development in the Historic Environment*, 2005.

Parramatta City Council, *Business Paper for Parramatta City Council Meeting of 23 April 2018*, Item 13.4 Parramatta CBD Planning Proposal Update, 23 April 2018.



Parramatta City Council, *Parramatta Development Control Plan (DCP), 2011, Amendment 19,* in force from 8 June 2018.

Parramatta City Council, Parramatta Local Environmental Plan (LEP), 2011.

Parramatta City Council, Parramatta CBD Council Response to the Parramatta CBD Heritage Study of Interface Areas (July 2017).

Parramatta City Council, *Planning Proposal Parramatta CBD Amendment to Parramatta LEP 2011*, Version 14 March 2016 - Council Meeting recommending Gateway Determination.

Planisphere, Development in Parramatta City and the Impact on Old Government House and Domain's World and National Heritage Listed Values: Technical Report (the Technical Report), 2012.

JOURNAL ARTICLES

Jervis, J, *The Cradle City of Australia – A History of Parramatta 1788-1961*, Council of the City of Parramatta.

INTERNET RESOURCES

Dictionary of Sydney: http://home.dictionaryofsydney.org

Google Maps: https://www.google.com.au/maps

NSW Legislation: www.legislation.nsw.gov.au

NSW LRS SIX Maps: https://maps.six.nsw.gov.au/

NSW State Heritage Inventory: Online Database: www.environment.nsw.gov.au/heritageapp/heritagesearch.aspx

Parramatta City Council: https://www.cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au/

Parramatta Heritage Centre Historical Research Library: https://www.cityofparramatta.nsw.gov.au/living-community/historical-research-library